

**THE BOOK  
OF THE  
OLD EDINBURGH  
CLUB**

---

The Journal for  
Edinburgh History



Various Authors, 'Book Reviews,  
*Book of the Old Edinburgh Club*, New Series, 7 (2008), pp. 177–190

~~~~~

This article is extracted from **The Book of the Old Edinburgh Club**, **The Journal for  
Edinburgh History** ISSN 2634-2618

Content © The Old Edinburgh Club and contributors. All rights reserved.

For information about The Book of the Old Edinburgh Club (BOEC), including contents of  
previous issues and indexes, see <https://oldedinburghclub.org.uk/boec>.

**This article is made available for your personal research and private study only.**

For any further uses of BOEC material, please contact the Editor, The Book of the Old  
Edinburgh Club, at [editor@oldedinburghclub.org.uk](mailto:editor@oldedinburghclub.org.uk). The Club has a Take-Down Policy  
covering potential rights infringements. Please see [http://oldedinburghclub.org.uk/oec-  
take-down-policy](http://oldedinburghclub.org.uk/oec-take-down-policy).



*Digitised by the Centre for Research  
Collections, Edinburgh University  
Library from the copy in the Library  
Collection*



## Book Reviews

Elizabeth Bryan and Alicia Bruce (eds), **Vivendo Discimus: By Living we Learn. The Life and Times of Riddle's Court.** *Edinburgh: Workers' Educational Association Scotland, 2008, pp. 70, illus. Not for sale, but available in local libraries, the Edinburgh Room and educational establishments.*

Riddle's Close is located on the south side of the Lawnmarket at the upper end of Edinburgh's Royal Mile. A narrow pend passing through the foreland building leads to an open area with a second pend beyond. This provides access to a small elegant courtyard, Riddle's Court, which is surrounded by a fine suite of buildings created in about 1590 by the wealthy Edinburgh merchant family, the MacMorrans. This book tells, in scrapbook form, the colourful and varied story of Riddle's Court from that time to the present day.

In 1558, George MacMorran purchased a foreland dwelling at the head of the West Bow. It was his son John MacMorran senior who bought up the nearby backland properties on either side of what is now called Riddle's Close and converted them to make a single grand new family residence with entry from the court controlled by a gatehouse. Many of his original building features, both external and internal, have survived, but the gardens which extended southwards were lost when Victoria Street and Victoria Terrace were constructed. He had only a few years to enjoy his house, however. As Bailie he was called upon to attend at the High School to quell what would now be called a sit-in by a group of pupils. Matters got out of hand and MacMorran was shot dead. A great scandal followed — nobody was brought to justice, as the pupils were all from influential families. John senior was succeeded by his son, John junior, and it was in his time that a great dinner was held by James VI and his Queen in honour of the Duke of Holstein, the king's brother in law. This was a truly great occasion, as evidenced by an extract from the Burgh Treasurer's Accounts which is reproduced in the book.

The Close and Court continued to house influential people in later years. One of those, described in the book, was Sir John Smith of Grothill. He was knighted by Charles I in 1631 and was Lord Provost of Edinburgh 1643–46. He was a Supervisor of the Solemn League and Covenant, a Member of the Committee of Estates and many other offices at a very

turbulent time in Scottish history. Around that time Scotland's Lord Chancellor and Lord President both lived in Riddle's Court. Almost a century later, in 1751, David Hume purchased a house in Riddle's Close. While living there he wrote his *Political Discourses* and began his *History of England*.

With the development of the New Town and the departure of the wealthier inhabitants, the Close fell on hard times. Census returns for the Close from 1841 onwards show multiple occupancy by large numbers of tradesmen, labourers, hawkers and others. Rescue came in the late 1800s when Patrick Geddes as part of his campaign to re-invigorate the Old Town undertook extensive repair and conservation work in Riddle's Court which he converted into accommodation for university students. He also instituted adult education Summer Meetings there, the first being held in 1896. The building was purchased by the Council in 1946 and in the 1960s became a centre for adult education, the Workers Educational Association taking a prominent part.

Sadly the WEA may have to leave Riddle's Court. The present book was written by people actively involved in the work there. It is attractively designed and well illustrated by the WEA's own Riddle's Court Photography Group. It tells a story that is well worth telling, particularly as a teaching aid, and also provides an example of how the non-professional can explore local history. One clear reservation, however: the task of those intent on doing this would have been made easier if information sources had been fully listed together with the locations at which they could be accessed.

ROBIN TAIT

Alistair McCleery, David Finkelstein and Sarah Bromage (eds.), **Papermaking on the Water of Leith.** *Edinburgh: John Donald, 2006, pp. 164, illus. Paperback, £7.99, 978-0-85976-672-2.*

'The bias [oral history] introduces into history is wholly welcome because it will necessarily direct the historian's attention to the fundamental common things in life; the elements of individual and social experience rather than upon the administrative and political chronologies'. Raphael Samuel argued in *Oral History* (vol. 1, no. 4, 1973) that history so often has such a bureaucratic bias because bureaucratic and administrative documents survive most often. Private

papers of important individuals and the business records of important companies are often preserved and researched by historians to create the definitive history.

But what of the workers who oiled the cogs of industry that created the success that made others wealthy, and which led to the business papers that form the historical record? Where does their record survive? Unfortunately, generations of workers have taken their record to the grave. Sartre's Roquentin in *Nausea* ruminates on those older people he observes. They live in a world of legacies and property. Their past is defined by possessions, but he has none and wonders where he should store his past, made up as it is of memories. 'You can't put your past in your pocket. You must have a house in which to store it ... a man on his own ... can't stop memories: they pass through him.'

*Papermaking on the Water of Leith* has created an admirable house for the memories and legacies of the surviving workers of this important Scottish industry. This work uses representative samples of interviews undertaken during the Water of Leith project that was an initiative of the Scottish Archive of Print and Publishing History Records (SAPPHIRE), a collaborative venture between Napier University and Queen Margaret University College, based in Edinburgh. Papermaking was an important part of the Scottish economy for hundreds of years, but little is known about the industry and paradoxically this may be attributed to the scarcity of paper records. Here we have a work that employs oral history, not to right the bureaucratic bias that concerned Samuel, but to form the basis of the historical record. As such it highlights issues that were important to the employees and members of the community – and 'community' figures strongly. It is an exploration of the papermaking industry that populated some of the loveliest parts of the riverbank from Balerno through Juniper Green, Colinton, Slateford, Dean and Canonmills, ending up in Leith.

The testimonies of the four men and three women featured in the book cover their work experience and family ties. They consider company housing, schooling, entertainment and social events and accidents, as well as the growing need for health and safety provisions, trade unions and workplace representation. The demise of the industry in the 1980s is attributed by some to the growing global economic pressures on small 'family' businesses, and among others to the arrival of 'outside' management: 'It

wasn't a family any longer, you know; it wasn't a family-run firm' (page 59). One contributor considered that there was 'an abundance of mills and they weren't very profitable. You had mills from abroad and cheaper papers coming into the country. [Woodhall Mill] closed in the January of 1984 ... I remember it quite clearly ... they started up and run out the systems after the holidays ... Everything shut down and washed up and that was it.' It was not only a blow to the mill workers but to the community that depended on the mill for its existence. The experience of village butchers, bakers and pub landlords are also considered. The whole community suffered, and this comes out strongly in the testimony: 'The mill was the soul of the community', according to one paper mill worker (page 108).

These testimonies offer a fascinating insight into an industry where workplace practices and terms (there's a useful glossary to mill terms) remained unchanged for a century or more. The quality of editing — supported by an excellent introduction, photographs and footnotes — makes this a highly readable account of life in the papermills on the Water of Leith. In the final analysis these testimonies are made all the more powerful because the world they relate to and remember is now gone.

HUGH HAGAN

Sheila Szatkowski, **Capital Caricatures. A Selection of Etchings by John Kay.** *Edinburgh: Birlinn, 2007, pp. 219, illus. Hardback, £9.99, 978-1-84158-658-8.*

The name and art of John Kay are intimately associated with a city and a time: Edinburgh in its golden age. This master of kindly caricature captured the features and foibles of his fellow citizens in a way that holds the interest across the years, and in a relationship between artist and viewer that will endure as long as men and women enjoy a pawky sense of humour. Nevertheless, much of the immediacy of this gentle satire is lost to most twenty-first century observers of Kay's portraits, indeed must have been lost within a generation or so of the portraits having been engraved and hung up in the window of the artist's Parliament Close shop. Events and allusions once the common talk of the town naturally faded from

the folk-tradition of the place, and with the passing of time and the clouding of memory both the image and the comment of the moment were rendered less relevant to posterity.

Kay was 'discovered' again by Hilary and Mary Evans in 1973. It is as well that each new generation should be reminded of Kay's remarkable achievement in all its delightful variety and eccentricity. A succession of editions and reprints, the latest of which was of inferior quality and in much reduced format, had kept alive Kay's original vision of Edinburgh's personalities through the nineteenth century. The letterpress accompanying the collection of portraits added much to the value of the whole, being rich in anecdote and with a charm of its own. Kay's prints hung on many an Edinburgh wall, and sometimes on walls far furth of the realm. I myself was brought up with his etchings in the background of life, so to speak, my mother having found some in an antiques shop in Durban, South Africa, and having bought them out of loyalty to and homesickness for her 'own romantic town'. Thither in due course they returned and in her Newington house still they hang, giving pleasure and wry amusement in the passing glance.

Sheila Szatkowski's new edition of the Kay oeuvre offers us something much superior to the rather similarly conceived and titled offering by Albert Morris in 1996. Morris's compilation, *Kay's Capital Characters*, was badly produced; took liberties with both plates and text; mixed different plates to make new compositions and juxtapositions; and added extraneous material such as topographical prints of Edinburgh and some John Jenkins caricatures for good (if confusing) measure. The plates as reproduced in the Birlinn Szatkowski volume are, by contrast, sharp and clear. They are, however, very small, reminding one of nothing so much as those very large postage stamps of insignificant countries that used to fill up the pages of many a child's album. Only with difficulty can one see the mole on John Bennett's right cheek (no. VI), to which the commentary calls attention. But, even at this diminutive size, one can still spot and take pleasure in small details such as the turned-up coat pocket of William Coke (XX), the unbuttoned gaiters and breeches of Robert Craig of Riccarton (XXIII), or the new-fangled laces tying John Dowie's shoes (XXVIII).

Making a selection of one hundred from the hundreds of Kay prints must always depend on

personal preference, and no anthology by one editor could possibly be the same as that chosen by another. This book contains many celebrated images and also many that will be less familiar. Thus there is one famous representation of Adam Smith, and also one less well-known; the excellent plate of Sir William Forbes; a not very relevant one of a Fife fiddler who appears to have strayed out of a Dutch painting of two hundred years earlier; and one double picture of Lords Errol and Haddo that I do not remember having seen before.

Szatkowski confesses her dependence upon the original biographical notices by Paterson and Paton that were supplied by the nineteenth-century publisher to accompany Kay's plates. There is in general very little in her commentary that is new, but it is mostly well and attractively put. There are flashes of humour: we learn that Dr Alexander Hamilton (L) relinquished his university chair of midwifery but retained his personal sedan chair. But sometimes one wishes for more clarity or enlightenment. In plate XXI there are six connoisseurs: two seem to remain resolutely unidentified. Comments might have been made to point, but are not. Dr John Brown (XIII) looks remarkably like Edward Gibbon. The faces in the background of number XCVII are not explained. Was this a plate re-used from some other exercise in etching? The commentary on XXXI misses the point that Dundas is in fact shown performing the function of that old street character, the 'wha-wants-me?' man, with his cloak and bucket to ease the discomfort of those taken short while abroad, these nasty accoutrements in this case being placed at the disposal of a nervous Lord Provost — an act of patronage of a kind. In considering Dundas again, in different guise, we may well think that there would surely have been little to gain in placing his statue upon his column facing *away* from the Palace of Holyroodhouse (commentary page 54) when the King never graced that erstwhile royal residence nor would have felt himself slighted in any way by such an empty gesture to an empty building. In plates V and LXXII surgeon and anatomist walk lizard-like beside what is evidently the same stretch of wall displaying distinctive droved ashlar masonry of differing patterns. The wall seems impervious to the social distinctions between these two branches of the medical profession. Three Methodist ministers also shuffle along it in no. XCVIII, John Wesley appearing as if under arrest by

the Edinburgh preachers on either side. Why exactly, on page 62, are we told about Richardson's *Pamela*? It would have been more interesting to have been informed, on page 124, of the gardener's house in Leith Walk, for which a scheme of conservation (and perhaps re-location) is now mooted. The route by which treasures from Lord Provost David Steuart's important private library passed ultimately to the National Library could be more clearly expressed (page 196).

Many biographical notices as recast by Sheila Szatkowski are both instructive and amusing. Those on pages 154 and 172 are examples. That on page 148 contains useful information of a social-history nature. But we might also have been offered some comment on the (perhaps surprising) prevalence of umbrellas in these Edinburgh prints: why so, in a city with all too little sun (their original purpose) and far too much wind to make the anti-rain device almost not worth the trouble of carrying? How nice to have seen one or two cast away in the street as background detail!

There are few errors of fact. Byron wrote a poem entitled 'English Bards and *Scotch* Reviewers' (page 130). Benjamin Bell (page 28) was surely an assiduous *chirurgian*. The London club (page 146) is *Brooks's*.

In a book of Edinburgh characters we might not expect to find Auld Geordie Syme, a piper from Dalkeith. Tom Paine was never in Edinburgh, so his inclusion seems otiose. Nor (at the extreme other end of the political spectrum) was William Pitt. It was a case of Kay having to go to London to find Pitt, rather than of Pitt finding Kay in Edinburgh, so he too is somewhat out of place in this anthology of Edinburgh face and figure, splendid caricature material as both constituted in Pitt's case.

The noise of Lauchlan M'Bain crying his ironmongery wares (LXIX) annoyed the judges of Kay's time, just as the mendicant pipers must do today as they stand playing outside the High Court or St Giles. The Lords of Session and Justiciary bought M'Bain's silence then. This might give their Lordships of our age an idea to pursue. The anecdote and the image of the raucous hawker offer a small indication of the timeless appeal of the totality of John's Kay's splendid world of caricature, and of the biographical and anecdotal treasure that forms the frame, as it were, of his graphic record. Of all this Sheila Szatkowski delightfully reminds us in her appealing and elegant book.

IAIN GORDON BROWN

George Dalgleish and Henry Stuart Fotheringham, **Silver: Made in Scotland.** *Edinburgh: National Museums Scotland, 2008, pp. 238, illus. Paperback, £29.99, 978-1-905267-13-2.*

It takes a book like this to remind us all how much opulent glory a small nation like Scotland could express through the exquisite artistry of her silversmiths. A sixteenth century reformation and seventeenth century factional violence doubtless cleared many altars and aristocratic dining rooms of glittering treasures, but the craft continued, and it flourishes up to the present day courtesy of artists such as Adrian Hope and Grant McCaig, amongst others, though it was the consumer boom of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries which, thanks to a largely middle class demand for flatware, coffee pots, candlesticks, waistcoat buttons and snuff mills, kept the molten metal running in every Scottish city and burgh of consequence.

This was an elevated trade which, almost literally, reflected the values of Scotland's enlightenment, and it seems somehow appropriate that its leading practitioners included Patrick Robertson, cousin of that era-defining architect, Robert Adam, and brother of the great historian, Principal William Robertson of Edinburgh University (who would himself receive a silver box from an admiring Catherine the Great).

No doubt endless melt-downs helped to keep the production going and the profits rolling in, as in the case of an enterprising fellow by the name of Duncan, said to have transformed a massive hoard of coins found during the demolition of the old Perth Mint into elegant tableware for the grandees of Marshall Place and its fashionable precincts. A tragedy for numismatists, perhaps, but a useful windfall for Mr Duncan, who used the wherewithal to set up as a pharmacist with his friend, Mr Flockhart.

Silver's misfortune was also that it was a means of exchange, as well as a medium for artistic expression. For a Covenanter fleeing to Rotterdam, or a Jacobite leaving in a hurry for France, a smuggled ingot or two might offer the difference between starvation and survival. For a farming family caught out in a bank crash, it could buy a passage to the New World and a few cheap acres in Kentucky.

Such asides as these, or the celebrated story of John Paul Jones stealing the Earl of Selkirk's silver

teapot in a daring raid on his Kirkudbrightshire estate, only to return it afterwards with the tealeaves still inside, are hardly relevant in a publication which is, in essence, a meticulously researched catalogue for what can only be described as one of the most impressive exhibitions of a specific Scottish design craft which the National Museum of Scotland has ever mounted.

Even so *Silver: Made in Scotland* is an absorbing read, with page after page of mouth-watering photographs, and fascinating snippets of social history. One discovers for example, that the real reason Henry Dundas abolished the tariff on coal exports (for which he received the exquisite Dumfries Freedom Box in about 1793) was almost certainly his fear of the radical excesses to which the likes of Robert Burns and his associates might be prone, rather than some innate motive of benign altruism. Such is the stuff of our heritage in silver!

DAVID J. BLACK

Hamish Coghill, **Lost Edinburgh: Edinburgh's Lost Architectural Heritage**. *Edinburgh: Birlinn, 2005, pp. xii + 260, illus. Hardback, £16.99, 1-84158-309-X; paperback (2008), £10.99, 978-1-84158-747-9.*

It might be wondered how such a weighty topic can be dealt with adequately in a single book of no great size, when a dozen volumes would scarcely be sufficient. Nonetheless, the author succeeds in his stated aim of leaving the reader 'with at least a flavour of what has been lost on the building front and ... something of the life of this old town.' It is not all about architectural loss, however. The opening chapter is more concerned with topography, and it also examines intangible traditions, such as the 'Gardyloo' method of waste disposal, and the allocation of various markets to specific locations.

The twenty-two chapter titles provide an intriguing indication of what is to come, though the contents do not always reflect what they suggest. The first chapter, entitled 'Paradise Lost', does discuss structures in addition to the topics just mentioned. These include the Old City Tolbooth, the city walls and gates, and the Luckenbooths and Krames. Just how some of these can be equated with Paradise is a little difficult to

imagine. True, the Krames (stalls jammed against the north wall of St Giles) were a treasure-house of childish delights, but the misery and degradation of the living conditions in the Tolbooth Jail provided the very antithesis of celestial bliss.

While lamenting the scale of destruction which has occurred over the centuries, Coghill distinguishes between that wrought by enemies (principally invading English armies) which might be regarded as an inevitable by-product of historical circumstances, and that which was largely self-inflicted (a much more common aberration), whether perpetrated by religious zealots at the time of the Reformation, by Victorian so-called 'improvers', or by modern greed-obsessed developers. Accidental destruction, for example by decay or fire, played a lesser but nonetheless significant role.

Sometimes buildings had the misfortune to be lost several times over. We learn that the functionally important Weigh-house at the head of the West Bow, built in 1352, was demolished by the English in 1381, rebuilt, then replaced in 1614, only to be demolished by Cromwell in 1650 because it impeded his siege of the Castle; another was erected in 1660 at the Restoration, but finally removed in 1822 so that the visiting King George IV might enjoy a smoother progress up to the Castle. As a corollary to that saga, many tales are told of buildings which changed as the institutions which had occupied them moved around town. Some are taken up to the present, while others stop short (e.g. the Trades Maiden Hospital).

On occasions, when a building was demolished, the loss was not total, and architectural relics and other features were saved. A good example of this was when the Netherbow Port was demolished in 1764: a dated lintel was saved and is now incorporated into a new structure nearby, which also houses its bell. This bell, the clock and the weather-cock were transferred first to the old, then to the new Orphan Hospital (now the Dean Gallery). Of these four relics Coghill mentions only two. It is sad to record that even some of these lost fragments were subsequently lost: in 1822 some fine detailing from the demolished Weigh-house failed to arrive at the nearby haven of the City Chambers, and when Trinity College Church was taken down in 1848 its stones were numbered and stored on Calton Hill so that it could be rebuilt, but so many were

pilfered during 24 years wrangling over its new site that the resultant Apse provides a rather puny reflection of its former glory.

By contrast, there was a successful rebuilding when St George's Free Church in St Cuthbert's Lane (now part of Rutland Street) was dismantled and re-erected in Deanhaugh Street in Stockbridge, but such schemes were rare. A striking example of substantial masonry retention is the 1846 facade of Lady Glenorchy's Low Calton Church in Greenside Place (next to the Playhouse). For several years it was propped up in slightly ridiculous isolation, and then had the huge bulk of the Glasshouse Hotel slapped onto its back — some might say to even more ridiculous effect. Hamish Coghill generally avoids making such judgmental comments, simply recording the facts, though he does allow that this relic 'provides an interesting reminder of what once stood there'. Be thankful for small mercies seems to be the message.

Not quite so bizarre is the situation of St George's Church, now West Register House, Charlotte Square. Coghill celebrates its rescue, but neglects to mention that its interior was entirely replaced by a steel and concrete structure quite unrelated to the preserved shell. There is another form of relic of which he makes no mention — mementoes made from the fabric of lost buildings, usually of timber, and fashioned into objects of decoration and utility. There is a fine collection of such relics in Huntly House, the Museum of Edinburgh.

One may detect a trend from the destruction of whole areas of quaint but anonymous buildings to the demolition of well known examples of fine architecture, notably villas. The prime example is Rockville (also known as 'Tottering Towers' and 'Crazy Manor'), the amazing Merchiston home of Sir James Gowans, a former Dean of Guild of the city. It was demolished in 1966 despite a vigorous public campaign, sacrificed to an insensitive developer's greed backed by a complicit Town Council. Rockville was the most spectacular of these lost villas, but it was by no means alone — also lost was the classical grandeur of Falcon Hall, Morningside (1780–1909), the antique baronial splendour of Grange House, and many more besides.

Other types of building were also lost in the name of development, including churches, theatres, dance-

halls, jails, breweries, cinemas, hospitals ... the list goes on. Fortunate indeed were those few which were converted to alternative uses. Banks and insurance offices seem to have been more fortunate than most in this respect, though there have been losses here too. Coghill reminds us that Edinburgh's inevitable expansion caused something else to be lost — its rural aspect. Small farms, crofts, dairies, rustic cottages, whole villages, and swathes of open countryside were casualties of the relentless tide of development.

Although this is a fine book in many ways, it is not without its flaws, some of which are serious. It is, as claimed, 'lavishly illustrated', with 144 illustrations (all monochrome and of variable quality), but they are unnumbered, and worst of all unsourced, which is a calamitous omission. Astonishingly the short bibliography lacks publication dates, and cites only books, not articles. The *Book of the Old Edinburgh Club* is accorded just two words, 'various volumes', and there are some glaring omissions, such as the work of Charles J. Smith and Malcolm Cant. Another omission is a location map, which would have been hugely useful. Of the many quotations used, some are attributed without a source, while others are left with neither, frustrating the reader seeking further information.

Dates are sometimes less than reliable. We are told that Calton Jail closed in March 1925 in the text, but March 1926 in the caption, while the rebuilding of Morocco Land occurred 'between 1958–6'. The sumptuous house ('palace') of Mary of Guise was demolished in 1845 according to the text, but in 1861 according to the caption on the same page. There are too many clumsy and confusing sentences, their convolutions leading to syntactical breakdown, and there is an unsettling imbalance of paragraph sizes. Captions are generally lengthy and informative, but too often they simply summarise the accompanying text, rather than explore and explain the illustrations, which are reproduced without acknowledgement. There is some repetition, even in the same line, including tautology (e.g. 'arched arcades'), and when talking of the shape of the West Bow, can one have a 'zig' without a 'zag'? Literals and solecisms are too numerous for comfort.

The architectural character and historical significance of the buildings featured are not always given the treatment which they merit. As part of an

overview of losses of buildings, much more could have been made of important aspects, such as the role of the Council's Dean of Guild, the campaigning of concerned individuals like Henry Cockburn and Patrick Geddes, and of bodies such as the Cockburn Association and the Scottish Georgian Society, and even of the Old Edinburgh Club itself.

It is difficult to read a book like this without feeling alternately depressed and angry. Amid his lengthy catalogue of calamitous loss, the author cannot restrain the occasional outburst of justifiable ire, such as 'The zeal with which the [early nineteenth-century] improvers set about their task was frightening in its intensity not to let anything — least of all the town's architectural history — stand in their way.' Coghill's book is a timely reminder, not just of the treasures which have been lost to the detriment of the social as well as the physical fabric of our city, but of the ever-present danger of further depredations: vigilance must be our watch-word.

Further losses have occurred since publication, for example the charming Red Home on the old Royal Infirmary site at Lauriston, swept away despite assurances of its preservation. *Lost Edinburgh* has a particular resonance in the centenary year of the Old Edinburgh Club. In the first lecture on 29 April 1908, William Cowan expressed regret that 'interesting old houses had disappeared, and said that something should be done in future to preserve houses of historical interest'. In the first article in the first volume of the Club's *Book*, Bruce Home lamented that 'Destruction, widespread, ruthless, and indiscriminating, has been the rule.' Yet Hamish Cogill can still end on a note of optimism: 'It can only be hoped that the best of the old will be preserved, and that the new will be good.' Amen to that.

GRAEME CRUICKSHANK

Alasdair Roberts, *Crème de la Crème*. London: Steve Savage Publishers Ltd, 2007, pp. 217. Hardback, £19.50, 1-904246-20-6.

Despite compelling evidence of their positive effects, the number of all-girls' schools in Edinburgh has fallen dramatically since Victorian times. At the beginning of the twentieth century there were several dozen. Now

there are just three. *Crème de la Crème* by Alasdair Roberts, its title inspired by the eponymous Miss Brodie's description of her special pupils in Edinburgh-born Muriel Spark's novel, sets out to describe the history and significance of girls' schools in Edinburgh. His main focus is the independent sector, noting that this was where a much higher percentage of secondary pupils were educated than was the case in other cities, and that most of these schools were single-sex.

Over the years, mergers and changes of location have been numerous and significant. Mergers often led to co-education. Two of the biggest schools were known colloquially by their locations: George Square and Queen Street. Some of the smallest schools disappeared without trace. Who now remembers Strathearn College, or St Anne's, or Rothesay House? One school considered to be unusual by virtue of its emphasis on self-discipline, was St Trinnean's, immortalised in Gerald Scarfe's cartoons and in the 1954 film with Alistair Sim. The real St Trinnean's closed in 1946. The last building it occupied in the city, St Leonard's, has been preserved by the University of Edinburgh as the centrepiece of its Pollock Halls of Residence campus.

Roberts picks out some famous Scots involved in the design of these schools, including Gillespie Graham, architect of the chapel at St Margaret's Convent, and Hippolyte Blanc, who was responsible for the famous roof garden at Mary Erskine's Queen Street building (on the roof it undoubtedly was, but there was not a blade of grass to be seen!).

We are told that the charging of fees was not always the exclusive preserve of independent schools. Some local authority schools, e.g. Gillespie's, Trinity and Leith Academy, were still fee-paying in the middle years of the twentieth century. Today, fees charged per term for tuition at an independent school in Edinburgh can be as high as £2500, with boarding extra.

The proximity of a school's main building to playing fields and public transport – the Suburban Railway played an important role here – was thought to determine not just sporting success but also general levels of physical health. This became quite competitive, with the Head of George Watson's Ladies College boasting that, thanks to easier access to playing fields for her girls than for pupils at



Edinburgh Ladies College (Queen Street), ‘girls at GWLC are taller and heavier than those at the Ladies’ College’. No worries about teenage obesity in the early years of the twentieth century!

An interesting chapter deals with arrangements to evacuate these schoolgirls during the second world war. When George Watson’s building in George Square was taken over by the Red Cross, pupils flitted across town to the suburban setting of the boys’ school in Colinton Road. More exotic wartime locations were enjoyed by the pupils of St George’s, who relocated to the Borders, by St Margaret’s girls, who were transferred to Dunkeld and by St Denis’s pupils, who enjoyed the grandest move of all, to Drumlanrig Castle.

Other outings and trips, if rarer than nowadays, were of a cultural nature, e.g. to Stratford in 1964 to mark the quatercentenary of Shakespeare’s birth. More recently, school trips have incorporated a work experience dimension, although quite why some pupils on a school trip to Giessen were required to go into shops with tape recorders, and ‘I have no money, do you have free cakes?’ as a standard greeting, is not explained.

Other chapters deal with uniforms, sports, school dances, former pupils clubs, magazines, and the performing arts. The scope of the book is wide, necessitating a comprehensive index, and it will make particularly interesting reading for anyone who attended one of the featured schools. These and other readers may, however, be disappointed that none of the wonderful photographs is dated, and that many of the incidents and personalities described are only sketchily contextualised. Extensive use is made of quotation marks, sometimes without any indication as to who is being quoted. For example, it is unclear whether a rather extraordinary statement about ‘that sense of escaping from rough children (which) lies deep in the Edinburgh psyche’ is the author’s own view or not. But his style is relaxed and often gently humorous. Whilst this is not really a coffee table book, it lends itself to being dipped in and out of. Many people will enjoy doing so.

A companion volume by the same author, on boys’ schools in Edinburgh, is expected soon.

**BRIDGET STEVENS**

Alison Hanham, **The Sinners of Cramond: The Struggle to impose Godly Behaviour on a Scottish Community, 1651–1851**. *Edinburgh: John Donald, 2005, pp. xii + 276. Paperback, £20.00, 0–85976–604–7.*

Peter and William J. Scholes, **Old Cramond**. *Catrine, Ayrshire: Stenlake Publishing, 2004, pp. 49, illus. Paperback, £7.50, 1–84033–303–0.*

John Dods, **Cramond Island: The Early History of the Island and its Role in Two World Wars**. *Cramond Heritage Trust, The Maltings, Cramond Village, 2006, pp. 47, illus. Paperback, £5.00, 0–9514–741–6–2.*

In the preface to Alison Hanham’s book, she lists the range of offences recorded in the Cramond Kirk Session minutes: ‘Apart from sexual misdemeanours and breach of Sabbath, especially by public drunkenness, offences over the years between 1651 and 1851 included cases of marital disharmony, maltreating a wife and (once) a child, exposing infants, infanticide and concealed birth, attempted abortion, escapes from custody, entertaining a member of the opposite sex behind closed doors, brawling, invented husbands, blasphemy, damaging gossip about kirk elders and lairds, poaching and theft (on the Sabbath), suspected brothel keeping, claims of rape (never accepted by session or presbytery), clandestine marriage, disturbances during a wake, maleficent cursing between neighbours and a girl’s allegation that she had been sold to the captain of a ship trading to Virginia. The plights of refugees, visiting beggars and the parish’s own poor and incapacitated are also illustrated.’

All these are detailed in the chapters that follow. The author has carefully disentangled the individual stories, following the references in the minutes, sometimes for years, so that outcomes and repeat offences are chronicled. Not surprisingly, the sinners were usually the working class poor, and many were made to sit publicly on the stool of repentance in front of the congregation on several successive Sundays before being absolved. A recurring way for men to avoid punishment or payment was simply to disappear to Edinburgh or another nearby parish, or, more drastically, join the army or run away to sea. The affairs of the kirk were run by the minister and the elders at the weekly kirk session meetings. Some of

the wealthy landowners of the parish — the heritors — were elders, but many were more involved with affairs of state in Edinburgh than with local matters, and appear in the records mainly when disputing the financial contributions that were expected.

The minute books start in 1651, the previous records having disappeared during Cromwell's occupation of Edinburgh. These were troubled times for the Scottish church, and succeeding chapters generally deal with the records from each minister's specific period of office. The spirit of the National Covenant informs the early years of the minutes, and the author detects some slackening during the Episcopal period before a further tightening after 1689. Although the range of offences was wide, a recurring theme is punishment of 'fornicators'. Men might escape more easily, but undeniable pregnancies left unmarried women with little defence.

By the eighteenth century the grip of the kirk was slackening, with an increase in other denominations, clandestine marriages available in Edinburgh, and, from mid century, the increasing industrialisation of the parish with the growth of the iron industry along the river Almond. By the 1760s the spirit of the moderates had reduced the emphasis on sexual misdeeds, and public humiliation on the stool of repentance fell out of use. For the 1790s the evidence of the Kirk Session minutes is supplemented by the deaf and dumb John Philp Wood's contribution to the first *Statistical Account* (1790) and his monograph on *The Ancient and Modern State of the Parish of Cramond* (1794; facsimile reprint, Cramond Heritage Trust, 1994). Hanham gives a useful biographical account and also draws on Wood's unpublished correspondence with local informants, particularly the Cramond-based surgeon, Robert Spotswood, and the Session Clerk and local schoolmaster, Ninian Paton.

In the nineteenth century the number of offences tails off, though whether because of renewed piety or reduced prosecutions is debatable, and the emphasis moves towards support of the deserving poor. The Disruption of 1843 saw the minister and much of his congregation side with the Free Kirk and move to found a new church in Davidson's Mains, leaving the depleted congregation at Cramond struggling to re-establish its authority. Besides its relevance to Cramond's church history, this book provides many revealing details about the ordinary social life of the

little township of Nether Cramond and its surrounding rural hamlets, and of the increasing links with the neighbouring metropolis of Edinburgh.

The little booklet *Old Cramond* is one of a series of collections of old post cards and photographs of districts and villages around Scotland. The Scholes, father and son, have gathered together an intriguing set of images, loosely arranged as a couple of walking tours, with a generous and informative linking commentary.

The first half of the book covers Cramond Kirk, House and Village, with photos of the old workers' houses before and after the full scale renovation by Ian Lindsay in 1960. It is fascinating to see the original rough shore at the river bank before it was built over for the promenade in the 1930s. A crowded beach scene is a reminder of the days when holidays meant making the best of what could be reached locally. The story of Cramond is brought into modern times with photos of the excavation of the remarkable Roman lion found in the mud at the ferry in 1997.

The second half starts by exploring the old iron mills along the Almond, with a very useful summary of the changing fortunes of each. Old Cramond Brig follows, and its successor, the turnpike bridge built by John Rennie in 1823. The tour then takes in the hotels at Cramond Brig and Barnton, Barnton railway and Station, then Cargilfield School and Fairafar cottages before returning to Cramond and the Victorian developments along Glebe Road. The book is full of fascinating photos and the text manages to include many unexpected pieces of information without becoming uncomfortably heavy. Fascinating for anyone familiar with Cramond, and every bit as good for an armchair tour as for use on the spot.

Another little booklet, *Cramond Island*, deserves notice, too. The scattered early mentions of this tidal island are collected in the first section. Originally in the hands of the Bishop of Dunkeld, it passed in 1574 to the Barnton Estate, and then in the mid nineteenth century to Lord Rosebery's Dalmeny Estate. There are references to its use as a 'cunninggar' (rabbit warren) in the medieval period, and the surrounding oyster fishing was important in the seventeenth century. There was an isolated farm house in the 1690s, when the Kirk Session was scandalised to find that 'a stranger gentlewoman was brought to bed in Robert Young's house in Cramond Island', though she was spirited away before they could deal properly with the

offence. Wood's *Parish of Cramond* records its use for an experimental flock of Shetland sheep by the British Wool Society in the 1790s.

Farming never prospered and by the 1860s the island houses, 'well adapted for sea bathing', were being let to holiday makers. By great good luck the author eventually made contact with the descendants of a family who had rented houses on the island for holidays between the wars, and the next section of the book deals with their happy memories of the place. There are delightful photos of family groups, picnics, clinker boats on the beach, tennis, swimming, model yachts on the old flooded quarry, a catch of flounders, a wee boy with a gun and his first rabbit.

The rest of the book deals with the use of the island by the military during the two world wars, trying to match the surviving traces on the ground to the official records. This is a specialised area of historical research but it is interesting to see how Cramond fitted into the bigger picture of the defence of the Forth, the rail bridge and the naval base at Rosyth. During the First World War Cramond Island was part of the middle defence line: wooden barracks, water tanks and gun emplacements were installed. Most were removed by 1921. At the start of the Second World War the island was requisitioned and civilian access barred. Anti-glider posts were erected on the low-water sands and a floating anti-shipping boom closed the gap between Cramond and the island, later reinforced by the line of concrete pylons still seen today. This was part of an anti-submarine system that ran on from Cramond island to Inchcolm and from Inchcolm to the Fife shore, with a moveable gateway to allow passage of Allied shipping. Guns were again installed, and electricity generated for the powerful searchlights that were used to pinpoint enemy aircraft, vessels or mines.

In a little known episode a Home Guard exercise to take the island was surprisingly, and embarrassingly, completely successful! The real German threat never materialised; the army presence was run down after the war with the major structures eventually flattened or removed. The book ends with a map and a discussion of the remaining traces of the old farm buildings, the gun platforms, stores, jetties, mooring blocks, generator houses and searchlight emplacements.

These three books all pay tribute to the resources of the Cramond Heritage Trust, whose little exhibition in the Maltings in the village highlights different aspects

of Cramond's history every summer, while acting as a centre for gathering information and artefacts relating to all aspects of the village's past, and as a constant pressure group for the better understanding of one of Scotland's oldest continuously inhabited sites.

ANDREW FRASER

Susan Varga, **Images of Scotland: Edinburgh Old Town, Stroud, Gloucestershire: Tempus Publishing, 2006, pp. 127, illus. Paperback, £12.99, 978-0-7524-4083-5.**

This attractive and informative book contains 200 illustrations selected by the author from the archive of the Edinburgh Room of the Central Library, Edinburgh. Nine areas of the Old Town are covered; Edinburgh Castle, Lawnmarket, Grassmarket, High Street, Canongate, Cowgate, George IV Bridge and Beyond, Closes and Holyrood.

The collection consists mainly of photographs which range from the 1840s to the 1960s, some previously unpublished. Among them are the evocative mid nineteenth century photographs by Thomas Begbie and the lesser-known Edinburgh surgeon, Dr Thomas Keith.

Also included is the photographic work of Francis M. Chrystal, one of the original members of the Old Edinburgh Club. Coincidentally on page 87 is a wonderful photograph, 'Old Edinburgh Club meeting at the foot of Blackfriar's Street, 1913' (see illustration on cover of this volume). It shows about thirty members, one lady resplendent in her feather boa, and the gentlemen in their assorted hats (bowlers, caps, and even a top hat).

There are at least six different views of the Castle from the Grassmarket. Comparing these it is possible to see chronologically the changes to the buildings of the north elevation of the Grassmarket (the Black Bull, the Beehive, etc).

This book illustrates how much of Edinburgh's architecture has sadly been lost to the planners and neglect. For example Bowhead House (demolished in 1878), with its wonderful example of architectural jettying, could have been stabilised and restored as an historical and picturesque asset to the Lawnmarket.

COLIN M. WARWICK

Susan Varga, **Images of Scotland: Edinburgh New Town, Stroud, Gloucestershire: Tempus Publishing, 2007, pp. 127, illus. Paperback, £12.99, 978-0-7524-4363-8**

Edinburgh's Georgian New Town was conceived as a solution to the overcrowding of the decaying, medieval Old Town. Designed as a residential northern suburb for the aristocracy it quickly became commercialised by fashionable shops.

This is a useful book and a suitable companion to *Edinburgh Old Town* (2006) by the same author and publisher. It consists of a fine collection of photographs, with the occasional map and engraving, from the Edinburgh Room of the Central Library where the author is employed. She writes that 'The Edinburgh Room has the most comprehensive collection in the world of material relating to Edinburgh.' Fortunately for historians these records are being digitised and being made available on the World Wide Web.

The book lists six phases of building the New Town, as well as the spanning of the valley with the North Bridge and the Earthen Mound, and the landscaping of Princes Street Gardens. This volume is generally well researched, with informative introductions to each chapter and interesting captions to the illustrations. For example they show the early facade of Princes Street in an era of elegant, uncluttered vistas. There are two photographs of the ceremony of laying the foundation stone of the (rebuilt) North Bridge (1896). Also illustrated is the inauguration of the Scott Monument (1846) which provided photographers through the years with an ideal viewpoint of Princes Street and the Castle.

Some of the photographs suffer from poor reproduction, for example a dark image of Waterloo Place (page 90), whereas the same photograph is perfectly reproduced as a frontispiece. The caption to Donaldson's painting of a view of the new bridge has left and right reversed (page 21), and the same mistake occurs in the caption to the photo of the rear of Waterloo Place (page 93). Two photographs of the Scott Monument construction in 1844 (page 23) are credited to Francis M. Chrystal, but the photographs are clearly by Hill and Adamson

This book, and its sister volume, will bring much pleasure to those interested in the pictorial history of Edinburgh.

COLIN M. WARWICK

Gavin Stamp, **Britain's Lost Cities. London: Aurum Press, 2007, pp. 186, illus. Hardback, £25.00, 978-1-84513-264-4.**

Gavin Stamp's important book examines the architectural losses suffered by nineteen British cities during the twentieth century, inflicted more by redevelopment than by Luftwaffe bombing. Edinburgh is one of three Scottish case studies, along with Glasgow and Dundee. In a short, sharp chapter the author describes the threats posed by an unholy combination of progressive but misguided planners, councillors and public bodies.

Stamp prefaces his concise account of the outstanding disasters of post-war planning and redevelopment with an evocative description of the architectural character of Edinburgh's historic centre. He contrasts the relatively sympathetic rebuilding of the Canongate during the 1930s and 1950s, with the proposals in the Abercrombie plan of 1949, which included new road systems, and wholesale demolition and rebuilding in the South Side and the area between Calton Hill and the New Town. Although only partly realised in the 1950s to 1970s these plans have profoundly affected Edinburgh ever since. Stamp briefly examines the decision to develop a walkway at first floor level along Princes Street. This became the excuse in 1966-67 to demolish the magnificent pair of William Burn's New Club and Charles Barry's Life Association of Scotland offices.

Next comes the destruction of three quarters of St James's Square and most of Leith Street, examples of integrated Georgian urban design which were less than pristine, but were unnecessarily removed. The striking photographs of this area emphasise Stamp's message. Of the unloved replacement buildings, the St James Centre has already required massive improvements, while the former New St Andrews House has lain empty for a large part of its life. Both buildings are due for wholesale redevelopment, and Stamp's book is essential reading for everyone involved in the process, citizen, developer and planner alike.

Enlightened attitudes towards the past were also absent in the University, whose interests were served by effecting the removal of large parts of George Square, a pre-New Town gem of Scottish domestic architecture, before it could reach its bicentenary in 1966. Stamp argues that universities 'seem always to be utterly convinced that their own perceived needs

transcend any wider issues of civic responsibility or public interest and so can behave with disgraceful arrogance'. His proof lies in the demolition in 1970 of the nearby Crichton Street tenements. Only in 2007 did the University begin to build on the vacant site.

The failure to prevent the mauling of George Square precipitated the formation of the Scottish Georgian Society. Although the growing conservation movement was not strong enough to prevent the later losses already described, it has had enormous influence. Stamp's focus on twentieth-century losses prevents him from considering the precedent in the creation of Edinburgh's civic society, the Cockburn Association, which arose because of the damage inflicted by the Victorians on their city, principally in the Old Town, in the name of planned improvement or piecemeal development. Did the quality of their buildings justify their actions? Was it possible only in the twentieth century to arrive at an appreciation that the original plain terraces of Princes Street assaulted by the Victorians might be of similar value to St James's Square? Stamp suggests that by the mid twentieth century the professionals at least should have known better, and he convincingly describes planners, architects and their clients in the grip of a collective modernising fever.

*Britain's Lost Cities* is written with the sure touch of a passionate and masterly architectural historian, and allows us to see Edinburgh's problems in their British context. Its beautiful photographs reveal the lost world of Britain's urban past, but it is not an exercise in nostalgia. Stamp's judgements on past mistakes are characteristically trenchant, but he is aware that it is impossible for a city not to change. In considering future developments in Edinburgh it would be prudent to heed his simple argument that Edinburgh's 'carefully composed and highly regarded physical fabric should have been treated with rather more respect'.

TRISTRAM CLARKE

Henry Stuart Fotheringham (ed.), **Edinburgh Goldsmiths' Minutes 1525–1700**. *Edinburgh: Scottish Record Society, issued to members 2006, pp.vii + 407. Hardback, ISSN 01439448.*

The Incorporation of Goldsmiths was perhaps the most prestigious of Edinburgh's craft guilds. Its members produced the gold and silver ware which adorned the

tables of wealthy burgesses and of the Scottish nobility, as well as the communion tables of churches in the Lowlands and beyond. This edition of the earliest records of the guild, beginning in 1525 not long after its formation as an independent guild separate from the Hammermen, provides a vivid sense of the wide role played by the guilds. With the assurance that only its burgh members could ply their craft in the burgh, the guild regulated its members and the standards of craftsmanship and trading. The work of unauthorised craftsmen could be seized and equipment broken up. Colourful incidents enliven the business. In 1563 the guild suspended Christian Galbraith from trading, following an incident in which he returned a diamond ring to the laird of Barns, having substituted a stone for the diamond, which he had sold to the jeweller George Heriot. Many examples show how the apprentice system drew in new blood to the craft, and it is no surprise to see how closely intertwined the leading goldsmiths' families became. The charitable function of the guild in supporting widows and indigent family members is also clear. The book is a veritable goldmine of information, with plenty of incidental sidelights on the social life of Edinburgh in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries.

The layout of the book follows that of the Goldsmiths' first minute book, deposited in the National Archives of Scotland since 1967. The manuscript original covers the period 1525–1738, but this volume takes the story only to 1700. There is a warning, however, about the reliability of the earlier records, for the period 1525–1637, as these were all transcribed into the new Minute Book by John Steuart, the clerk in 1637, from originals that are now lost. There are a number of demonstrable mistakes in transcription, but others will have remained undetected, and it is unclear how much Steuart may have modernised spellings, etc. The entries are not in a single chronological sequence but were arranged by Steuart in three basic categories: first the record of essays and admissions and elections of deacons, etc, of the incorporation; second the booking of apprentices; and third the acts and statutes of the Goldsmiths. This arrangement has been followed in the printed volume.

The standards of the Scottish Record Society in rendering the original Scots text have been maintained, despite some minor editorial slips, for example an intriguing index entry to Flodden leading nowhere, and an incomplete reference in note 7. There is an

extensive index, though the variety of spellings sometimes leads to difficulties in tracking down individual names. Thus I sought in vain for Zacharius Millenus or Millenous or Millinus, before a chance finding led me to him under Mellinus. There is a further challenge in three long lists of names (pp. 13–17, 270–271 and 352–353) where only those admitted before 1700 are included in the index, with no indication of which names lay after this cut-off date, and the lists themselves apparently not entirely chronological. The editor confines his remarks to the text and his approach to it, and promises an assessment of the significance of the contents in a separate history of the incorporation. Meanwhile this useful volume tells us much about a key Edinburgh trade and an important aspect of Edinburgh's past.

ANDREW FRASER

Diane M. Watters, **St John's Episcopal Church, Edinburgh.** *Edinburgh: Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland, 2008, pp. vi + 58, illus. Paperback, £7.50, 978-1-902419-51-0.*

After St John's Church, Princes Street, was completed in 1818, in a refined revival of the Perpendicular style of Gothic, it was observed 'St John's is like a Dutch toy, and St Cuthbert's the box it came in'. William Burn's design was a great change from the box-like episcopal chapels built until then, and it also contrasted with the Edinburgh episcopalians' first adoption of the Gothic revival at James Adam's St George's Chapel, York Place (1792), a centrally planned church dressed in Gothic. This approach became outmoded by the trend towards historical correctness after 1800. For nearly thirty years observers of St John's Church must also have been struck by the contrast between its smart, ornate symmetry and the relative plainness of the late medieval Trinity Church, still standing at the other end of the valley of the Nor' Loch. St John's contained a nave and two aisles, with slender columns drawing the eye up to the plaster fan vaulting. This was new for a Scottish church, and added to the impact on the New Town being made by the contemporary church of St Paul's, York Place, which was opened just before St John's by another episcopal congregation. There Archibald Elliot displayed similar sensitivity to medieval models in creating a neo-Perpendicular church with aisles.

The chief merit of this short, valuable book by an accomplished architectural historian is its fresh study of the architecture of a familiar Edinburgh landmark. It successfully complements the existing histories of the congregation by a lively account of the value and purpose of the Gothic revival style employed by the architect William Burn, who drew his inspiration from English medieval churches. He is credited here with an advanced, scholarly design in his chosen style, which was eclipsed later by the 'purer' forms of Gothic revival championed by Pugin and others. Diane Watters provides an absorbing account of how St John's was created, and then adapted to suit general liturgical and architectural developments, especially by the formation of the distinctive chancel in 1882. She also devotes space to the profusion of stained glass and mural monuments, which attest to the status, wealth and imperial involvements of the congregation of this, the smartest of episcopal churches before St Mary's Cathedral. The quality of this book matches the richness of its subject, as it is illustrated with 60 excellent photographs, engravings and architectural drawings. It is greatly to the credit of the RCAHMS, which, like the Old Edinburgh Club, is celebrating its centenary, and it is to be hoped that more studies of this calibre of Edinburgh buildings will follow.

TRISTRAM CLARKE

Alan Harding, **A Victorian Church in Edinburgh's Old Town: St Columba's Episcopal Church in Context.** *Edinburgh, 2005, vii + 225 pages. Available from Cornerstone Bookshop, Edinburgh. Paperback, £8.95. No ISBN.*

St Columba's is a curious survivor: a church built in 1845–46 in Johnstone Terrace, still flourishing 160 years after its foundation, in defiance of the trend of unions and closures which has witnessed the disappearance of many congregations in the Old Town. Alan Harding sets out to answer, among other questions, how and why this happened. His interesting story begins in the turbulent decade of the 1840s, when disruption not only affected the established church, but also the episcopal congregation of St Paul's, Carrubber's Close. A division over the desire of some members to adopt the Scottish Communion Office intersected with a move to build a church and school for the benefit of poor Irish and English episcopalians

in the Old Town. The result was that a missionary priest, John Alexander, and a vestry led by a group of socially aware lawyers, began to promote high liturgical worship and education for poor children from the new premises on Johnstone Terrace. The laity who refused to change remained in their plain chapel for over thirty years, until they moved to the church now known as Old St Paul's.

The author makes excellent use of the unusually rich documentation that survives in the church records, bringing to life his cast of clergymen and laity, who were frequently, like in all denominations, at odds. He also provides useful coverage of social conditions of the Old Town, and the running of the school, which formed a basement below the church. As his title indicates, this is a story of one congregation told in

context, and there is much here on the similarities and contrasts between the work of the High Church episcopalians at St Columba's and their Established and Free presbyterian neighbours, not to mention other Edinburgh episcopal congregations. The sources are clearly footnoted for readers to pursue, but the lack of an index may impede their use of this substantial work, and the overall production does not do justice to the content. The author has since published a shorter account under the same title in the *Records of the Scottish Church History Society* (vol. 37, 2007), but anyone with a serious interest in Edinburgh's social and religious development during the last century and a half, will wish to read this full history.

*TRISTRAM CLARKE*