

**THE BOOK  
OF THE  
OLD EDINBURGH  
CLUB**

---

The Journal for  
Edinburgh History



Various Authors, 'Book Reviews,  
*Book of the Old Edinburgh Club*, New Series, 4 (1997), pp. 149–163

~~~~~

This article is extracted from **The Book of the Old Edinburgh Club, The Journal for  
Edinburgh History** ISSN 2634-2618

Content © The Old Edinburgh Club and contributors. All rights reserved.

For information about The Book of the Old Edinburgh Club (BOEC), including contents of  
previous issues and indexes, see <https://oldedinburghclub.org.uk/boec>.

**This article is made available for your personal research and private study only.**

For any further uses of BOEC material, please contact the Editor, The Book of the Old  
Edinburgh Club, at [editor@oldedinburghclub.org.uk](mailto:editor@oldedinburghclub.org.uk). The Club has a Take-Down Policy  
covering potential rights infringements. Please see [http://oldedinburghclub.org.uk/oec-  
take-down-policy](http://oldedinburghclub.org.uk/oec-take-down-policy).



*Digitised by the Centre for Research  
Collections, Edinburgh University  
Library from the copy in the Library  
Collection*



## Book Reviews

Donald Campbell, **Playing for Scotland: A History of the Scottish Stage, 1715-1965**. Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 1996, pp. 168. Paperback, £9.99, 0-1873644-574.

This very readable book traces 250 years of the Scottish stage: from Allan Ramsay to Sadie Aitken, from a playhouse in Carrubber's Close to the Gateway Theatre, from the Kirk condemning theatre as evil to the Kirk owning a theatre in Edinburgh.

Where he can, Campbell emphasises any Scottish elements apparent on Scottish stages, but the anglicising effect of the Union in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries, culminating in the coming of the railways which enabled whole theatre companies to travel by train throughout the United Kingdom, ensured an overpowering London influence and the creation of a British theatre. Until this century almost the only indigenous Scottish plays were adaptations of the novels of Walter Scott. Furthermore, actors are strolling players, travelling wherever in search of an audience. From Henry Erskine Johnston ('Young Norval') to Alistair Sim, Scottish actors have gone to London to expand or make their reputations, while English actors have appeared on Scottish stages as visiting stars or as members of stock or repertory companies. Campbell makes the distinction clear between such companies.

Yet theatre, albeit British, flourished in Scotland, despite problems of licensing, political interference, artistic temperaments and rivalries, fires, riots, and most of all, financial problems. Campbell describes the rise and fall of playhouses and companies and individuals, mainly in Edinburgh in the early chapters, but also in the other cities and on circuit. He is particularly good in bringing to life, or larger than life, the actor-managers and other characters who graced, and sometimes disgraced, the Scottish stage.

In the later chapters, Edinburgh has given way to Glasgow, where this century a truer Scottish theatre began to develop, thanks to the talents of such as James Bridie and Robert McLellan. Due credit is also given to Joe Corrie's *Fife Miners* and to the amateur dramatic movement. Yet *Bunty Pulls the Strings* had its successful premiere in London.

Donald Campbell started off as a stage-hand in the King's Theatre in Edinburgh. He has written fine

Scottish plays such as *The Widows of Clyth*. This well researched short history of the Scottish stage demonstrates his love and knowledge of the theatre and a deep understanding of the men and women who are part of it.

CECIL SINCLAIR

Richard Saville, **The Bank of Scotland: A History, 1695-1995**. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1996, pp. xxxv + 1089. Hardback, £50.00, 0-7486-0757-9.

With thirty chapters, 1100 pages, tables and appendices aplenty, this is an academic blockbuster. But it needed to be, given the place that the Bank of Scotland has played in Scottish life over the three hundred years since its inception in 1695. There is a popular conception that banking history is dull, peopled only by grey men working at big dusty ledgers on boring financial transactions, grinding on minutely to achieve safe profit. Saville very effectively challenges this view. His is certainly a rigorous analysis, which draws on a wide range of sources, and one which is intellectually challenging on the debates and issues in banking policy, whether of the eighteenth or the twentieth century. But he also makes room for the place of personality as well principle, for villains and fraudsters as well as *douce* Edinburgh men. The affair in 1801 of the Haddington agent shows that Nick Leeson has merely followed a well trodden path, save that in this particular episode the peculations of the agent did not bring down the Bank. The book adds in this respect to Alan Cameron's *Bank of Scotland: A Very Singular Institution*, which appeared last year, also as part of the tercentennial celebrations, which is so very strong on the problems posed by the forgery of banknotes. Cameron deals in much more depth with the conditions of working for the staff, and with the architecture of the Bank's offices, such as the building of the Head Office, which is so conspicuous a feature of the Edinburgh skyline.

Some tried and tested notions are challenged by Saville and reversed. It has long been argued that Scottish banks were unwilling to lend to industry, being more interested in the safer returns from land

and housing. Not so, shows Saville, whether in the context of oil in the 1970s, or support to the Carron Company after the collapse of the Ayr Bank in the early 1770s. But what does emerge clearly, generation after generation, is the mind-set of Scottish bankers, particularly those of the Bank of Scotland: careful, prudent, and not to be drawn into more adventurous and risky forms of investment favoured by others, often to their own and their shareholders' cost.

If there is a central chapter amongst so many, it is that entitled 'The Mind of the Scottish Bankers', which analyses the thinking of the Enlightenment writers on the role of banks, and the principles developed and adhered to by bankers themselves, in pursuance of the need above all to create and sustain a sound financial platform for the Scottish economy, echoes of which still pertain today. Saville explores in convincing detail the actual mechanisms, direction and effects of bank lending, from the cash credit given in the early nineteenth century to an ironmonger at Kilmarnock, and across the Border, to one Ann Potts, a farmer in Northumberland.

This is a massive contribution to our understanding of the Scottish economy since the late seventeenth century. Saville's is a view from the high ground of the Bank's directors' and managers' perspective of what could and should be done by way of banking policy in times of prosperity and recession, of challenge and consolidation. He is to be congratulated on such a perceptive and fascinating account of the Bank's history. A number of us will have to rewrite our assessment of the history of Scottish finance.

ALASTAIR DURIE, *University of Glasgow*

Kitty Cruft and Andrew Fraser (eds), **James Craig, 1744–1795, 'The Ingenious Architect of the New Town of Edinburgh'**. *Edinburgh: Mercat Press, 1995, pp. 134, illus. Paperback, £9.99, 1-873644-40-X.*

The belated review of this book is justified somewhat by the satisfying designation of Edinburgh's Old and New Towns as a World Heritage Site, an event assisted no doubt by such scholarly studies as appear here. The volume was devised as one item marking the bicentenary of the death of the architect of

Edinburgh's First New Town, supported by the Edinburgh New Town Conservation Committee and its then director Desmond Hodges. For the historian this is a wonderful – even stylish – piece of intellectual memorabilia, and the review copy will make a superb addition to the burgeoning reference library at the Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland.

I can heartily commend the approach adopted by the editors. They present the history in a carefully orchestrated thematic sequence of autonomous yet complementary essays, all specially prepared by recognised authorities. Consequently the reader can enjoy personal insight, enthusiasm and expertise in great variety. Admittedly the development of themes is not always successful – Charles McKean's challenging semiology of the New Town and Connie Byrom's examination of its open spaces do not benefit from their juxtaposition. But the light hand of the editors is correct in principle, and as the essays stand on their own, readers may dip in and follow their own interests in comfort.

Creditable too is the 'Descriptive List' that concludes the volume. Any monograph should provide the historian with such an invaluable tool, but seldom do time, space and energy allow for its inclusion. We must thank Anthony Lewis, Kitty Cruft and Andrew Fraser for their crisp and succinct – and thereby all the more useful – notices.

The centre-piece of the book is Fraser's magisterial review – and re-writing – of the history of Craig's plans for the New Town. Following in the paths of the most successful historians, Fraser brings new meaning to material dismissed by others. His interpretation of Craig's 'Circus Plan' in the Huntly House Museum allows us to understand it as a combination of two alternative early proposals. He dates it to 1766, tentatively, as should an historian, but convincingly, as befits a strict logician.

Cruft and Lewis provide a succinct biography, and remind us of the hard life of an architect possessing more intellectual aspirations than his money or his talent could support; Ian Grant supplies the background to the development of the New Town; while Iain Brown, Lewis and Ian Gow provide a concluding trio of exciting essays exploring the artistic and bibliographic evidence.

This book is to be recommended not only to lovers of Edinburgh, but to anyone interested in classical planning and architecture. However a wider



context to Craig's work – and Edinburgh's New Town – would have been a useful bonus. McKean makes the approach, but is it fair to presume that all prospective readers are so familiar with A. J. Youngson's *Making of Classical Edinburgh* and other basic works? As Craig's lack of wider experience undermined his later success, the narrow focus of this volume may not attract the wider audience that would otherwise relish its exemplary scholarship.

SEAN O'REILLY, *Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland*

Iain Gordon Brown, **Elegance and Entertainment in the New Town of Edinburgh: The Harden Drawings.** *Edinburgh: Rutland Press, 1995, pp. 48, illus. Paperback, £4.95, 1-873190-17-4.*

This slim volume, produced to mark the bicentenary of the death of James Craig, planner of the New Town, consists of an essay on the Harden drawings and diaries in the National Library of Scotland, punctuated by examples of the drawings themselves. Although John Harden was also an accomplished watercolourist – many of his views and outdoor scenes are well known and have been written about before – this book concentrates chiefly on the drawings and paintings of Edinburgh interiors of the early nineteenth century, populated by elegant gentleness elegantly employed. Dr Brown's knowledgeable essay points out the valuable architectural detail in the drawings, and the evidence not only of what furniture existed but of how it was used.

Quotations from Jessy Harden's copious journal punctuate the essay and bring the interiors to life, with their not always polite commentary on entertainments and people. The journal was addressed to her sister in India, intended to keep her up to date with Edinburgh life, and it mentions the social circle in which Jessy and John Harden moved, the military activity of the period, and the building development in Edinburgh and Leith at a time of vast and rapid change. There is a great emphasis on art: Jessy was a serious painter and sketcher in her own right, and their circle included notable artists of the day, among them Raeburn and Nasmyth.

Lengthier extracts from Jessy Harden's diaries

were published in the *Book of the Old Edinburgh Club* in 1959 (vol. 30, pp. 60–118), but with its emphasis on illustrations Dr Brown's book forms a brief tempting introduction to the diaries and sketches, and serves to describe a less well known source for an important period in Edinburgh's history.

N. J. MILLS, *Scottish Record Office*

Jane Thomas, **Midlothian: An Illustrated Architectural Guide.** *Edinburgh: Rutland Press, 1995, pp. 136, illus. Paperback, £9.95, 1-873190-26-3.*

In the small county of Midlothian can be found a sample of almost every aspect of life in Lowland Scotland. Almost all Midlothian is to be seen from Soutra, in a view which is dear to the heart of the traveller coming home from the south, and almost all of the county can be found in Jane Thomas's *Midlothian*. This is one of a series of architectural guides which also contain much on owners and builders, and on the lore and history of the area, and the results serve as very useful general guidebooks.

The compact format leaves little space to spare. Of the buildings described within *Midlothian* perhaps only Rosslyn Chapel is of the very first rank, but the couple of pages devoted to it can only whet the appetite. Other major buildings such as Crichton Castle, Hawthornden, Dalkeith Palace, Arniston and Mavisbank are among the many country seats which ring Edinburgh. They are all covered, but in perhaps only a third of the space which Colin McWilliam was able to give in the *Lothian* volume of the Penguin Buildings of Scotland series, and inevitably the descriptive detail gives way to broader strokes.

This book gives more attention to the many important industrial sites in the area, such as the very fine Lady Victoria Colliery at Newtongrange. The attention given to such unassuming buildings, together with the excellently chosen literary extracts, gives a clear impression of the economic and social development of the county. Jane Thomas provides deft and evocative descriptions, albeit without the acerbic wryness of the volumes written by the series editor, Charles McKean. Where this series really scores is in the illustrations, both verbal and pictorial. If you don't have the space for a thousand words then a picture is far better at defining the appearance of a

building, particularly one which does not fit a clear architectural stereotype. The densely packed result is a mouth-watering reminder of just how many interesting buildings one has yet to discover. It should be on your shelves, but never for long.

PERRY CLARKE

Richard Jaques and Charles McKean, **West Lothian: An Illustrated Architectural Guide**. *Edinburgh: Rutland Press, 1994, pp. iv + 116, illus. Paperback, £8.95, 1-873190-25-5.*

A note on the back page of this, one of the latest of the Royal Incorporation of Architects of Scotland's illustrated architectural guides, asks: 'Are you building up the set?' For the present reviewer the answer is probably no (his interests are Glasgow, Edinburgh, Orkney, Shetland and, happily, West Lothian), but the question is a fair one. They are indeed a set. The book calls the attempt to cover all Scotland in this way by the end of the millennium a 'mad idea', but it is an inspired madness. The volumes are a beautiful, entertaining and authoritative introduction, not merely to the architecture of Scottish localities, but to the broader culture too, using a wide variety of sources and illustrations. For West Lothian we have grave inscriptions, contemporary visitors' accounts, illustrative pieces of doggerel, pen portraits of builders and prominent occupiers – Lord Hermand, Sir J. Y. Simpson, 'Paraffin' Young. The copious visual material consists chiefly of photographs, but there are also maps, drawings, reconstructions. Particularly noteworthy are the small vignettes drawn from the maps of Timothy Pont, evidence of Charles McKean's fascinating work in that area.

West Lothian today tends to be an area through which one passes on the way to somewhere else along one of 'the five parallel east/west routes that have sliced this land like a loaf of bread'. Its architecture is divided between: the historic 'chateaux and manors ... which clustered round the magical royal shrine of Linlithgow'; those communities 'whose only possible rationale was profitable local work' and which are now 'beached, neglected and forgotten'; and the 'phoenix of Livingston', the area's successful new town. All this is in the book, from Linlithgow Palace to the

Livingston Motec, from Cairnpapple to the Regal Cinemas of Broxburn and Bathgate, the Goth at Armadale, Blackness Castle, Blackburn, Whitburn, Fauldhouse, Longridge ...

Architecture does not of course confine itself to localities and there are comparisons and cross-references with other areas. The legal problems attending the founding bequest of Bathgate Academy are compared with those of Morgan Academy, Dundee, and another Dundee parallel is offered for the Venetian windows of Belsyde House, reminiscent of the work of Samuel Bell. In such a wide-ranging work there is bound to be the odd error. Bellsquarry was, we are told, the source of the stone for the National Monument on the Calton Hill in Edinburgh. However in the *Edinburgh* volume Professor McKean tells us that the stone was from Craighleith. A more general criticism, albeit a mild one, concerns Richard Jaques's drawings and watercolours. These seem very able, but are generally shrunk to an inch or two square, sometimes in black and white. This hardly does them justice or makes them especially informative. Charles McKean's reconstruction of the High Street of Linlithgow, while very interesting, might have benefited from the attentions of a fully-fledged architectural draughtsman.

However, enough of that. This is a wonderful treasury, soon to be followed by others which will eventually make up the set. If the timescale can be maintained the 'mad idea' will then be completely loosed on the community – as good a way of celebrating the millennium as any I can think of.

PETER ANDERSON, *Scottish Record Office*

Donald Smith, **John Knox House: Gateway to Edinburgh's Old Town**. *Edinburgh: John Donald, 1996, pp. v + 74, illus. Paperback, £6.50, 0-85976-437-0.*

'The physical and documentary integrity of the site and its building provides a unique viewpoint or window on the social, cultural and economic life of the period.' This sentence provides the key to the many strengths of this book. The opportunity to carefully re-examine this important building was taken during its recent restoration. The author has therefore been able to combine his own extensive documentary researches with an in-depth analysis of



the building. This has enabled many of the questions about this most prominent of houses in the Old Town to be answered. This modest book contains a wealth of information, which is lavishly illustrated with engravings, photographs and, perhaps most unusually, plans. The layout is clear and logical: firstly, the story of the house on the Netherbow, then the plans and sketches, followed by the guided tour which thankfully closely follows the main text. The book concludes with brief synopses of the house, John Knox and James Mossman. With such clear signposts even the most desultory of readers will gain a lot from this work.

Dr Smith takes us through the development of the buildings on the site from the mid fifteenth century to the present. He explains succinctly how the house came to occupy such a prominent site within the development of the Netherbow Port. Alexander Boncle, the developer, and his son-in-law Walter Reidpath are the first characters involved. The site then passed through marriage to the Royal Goldsmithing dynasty of the Mossmans. Smith gives us an insight into the social structures of sixteenth-century Edinburgh and more especially of the burgesses. Later the house was subdivided and tenanted, becoming in the eighteenth century a largely commercial building. The story of how the structure survived, and its many restorations beginning in 1850, provides an insight into early building preservation history. He manages to deflate the myth of the connection of the house with John Knox whilst stressing the importance of this relationship in the survival of the building. The involvement of the Church of Scotland and the creation of what almost amounts to a shrine to the great reformer is explained, as well as the creation of the Netherbow Arts Centre on the site of the Knox Church. It is interesting that the history of the house is brought up to the present, thus enabling the reader to understand the building as it is today. John Knox House, over the last few decades, has been reappraised and is now rightly regarded as an unique survival of a sixteenth-century house. This relatively modest book explains clearly and concisely the history of the building. Would it not be wonderful if the same treatment could be given to other buildings in the Old Town?

SIMON GREEN, *Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland*

Michael Barfoot, 'To Ask the Suffrages of the Patrons': Thomas Laycock and the Edinburgh Chair of Medicine, 1855. London: Wellcome Institute for the History of Medicine, *Medical History, Supplement No. 15, 1995*, pp. xvi + 226. Hardback, £25.00, 0-85484-062-1.

Thomas Laycock (1812–1876) was elected to the Chair of the Practice of Medicine at Edinburgh in 1855. He had been brought up in poverty near York and with financial help from the Wesleyan Connexion was apprenticed to surgeons in Bedale. Most of his formal medical education was gained at the University of London: he also studied at Paris and was an MD of Göttingen. From 1839 he was a general practitioner in York.

The Edinburgh medical faculty was full of famous names and strong characters such as John Hughes Bennett, Robert Christison, James Y. Simpson and James Syme. The faculty had no direct influence on the election, for that was in the hands of the Town Council. Of this body of thirty three men, only one is remembered today, the rough and radical William Dick, founder of the Edinburgh Veterinary College. Syme, the Professor of Surgery, complained that:

Every candidate ... must personally canvass all of those individuals and bring influence to bear upon each of them. He must publish volumes of testimonials, and have a committee constantly in action to promote his claims ... The patrons ... have no means of knowing the merits of the candidates, except through testimonials, as to the respective value of which they are incompetent to judge (p. 31).

Syme said that non-medical and non-professional factors were given weight by some councillors, and Laycock confirmed this when he observed that ex-Bailie Gray had supported him partly because 'in the dedication of [Laycock's] *Religio Medicorum* he had shown much pious reverence towards his mother' (p. 89).

Dr Barfoot begins with an extended introduction in which he describes the events of the election and their background. With a cast of wilful spirits and several disappointed men, all of his sympathy is needed to ensure a balanced account. The largest part of the book consists of documents, chiefly Laycock's own account of combats which began on the day J. Y.

Simpson suggested he should become a candidate. A few months later he wrote: 'Congratulations follow immediately after victory; then the calm before new struggles' (p. 97). How right he was: he had a difficult time with his abrasive colleagues.

Laycock was in Edinburgh at the point when the professional mastery of the physician was being challenged by increasingly successful surgeons: this is the period of chloroform and antiseptic surgery. Laycock's investigations were in another area, mental illness. His work was unfashionable: the ideas and achievements of this perceptive and acute thinker await detailed study.

This book is valuable because it opens up two important areas of history. First, it illustrates a great medical school in slow decline from a peak seventy or a hundred years earlier, when it led the world. The argle-bargling between the distinguished professors ensured that it would not recover its place: it was already far behind Paris. Second, it introduces Thomas Laycock as a major figure. There is much more to know about this period: Dr Barfoot is to be thanked and congratulated.

JOHN BURNETT, *Royal Museum of Scotland*

Charles J. Smith, **Edinburgh's Contribution to Microbiology**. *Wellcome Unit for the History of Medicine, University of Glasgow, 1994, pp. 312, illus. Paperback, £20.00, 0-9511765-6-0.*

Charles Smith is well known as author of *Historic South Edinburgh* and a popular lecturer on local history and topography, and it may surprise his admirers to discover another strand of his expertise in this more specialist book, which stems from his former career as Senior Chief Medical Laboratory Scientific Officer in the Department of Bacteriology at Edinburgh University Medical School. Professor Gerald Collee recruited Charles Smith to record his researches into the department's history after his retirement in 1982, and acted as editor and promoter of the volume: together they have seen the project through to triumphant conclusion. The task expanded as it progressed, with the need to include the 'prehistory' of the subject, from Joseph Lister's pioneering studies on antiseptics in the Royal Infirmary long before a specialised bacteriology

service was provided in either the hospital or the university, and the later broadening to include the sister disciplines of immunology and virology, reflected in the renaming of the University department as Medical Microbiology in 1990. The field widened further to include mention of Public Health provision and Fever Hospitals in the city, and the varied range of diagnostic and research facilities provided at different times at the Royal College of Physicians laboratory, and the labs at the City Hospital, the Western General, the Astley Ainslie and other Edinburgh hospitals. The title is, therefore, deliberately broad, and the book gives a very full picture of the complex development of medical microbiology in Edinburgh during the past hundred years.

The text is arranged chronologically, with separate chapters for the reign of each professor since the Robert Irvine Chair of Bacteriology was created in 1913, followed by résumés of the development of other Edinburgh labs. The comprehensive nature of the book is indicated by the fact that a substantial appendix gives biographical details of some 150 people who were associated at some time with the department, from technical staff to lecturers, research workers to professors (including many still active in careers elsewhere, though excluding current staff), and this is complemented by a section containing over 120 photographs of individuals. Throughout, the text is richly illustrated with photographs of people, ceremonies, laboratories, title-pages, presentations, buildings, staff groups, etc., the result of astonishing perseverance in pursuing obscure leads and far-flung descendants. There are a few puzzles, though: why should Professor Marmion appear twice in the same chapter, in exactly the same photograph; and what was the story behind the two photos showing different lecturers, each in the same pose gesturing at the same blackboard diagram and surrounded by the same group of rapt students?

This book takes its place with a limited number of other studies on specific disciplines or departments in the University of Edinburgh, e.g. those on Astronomy (H. A. Brücke, 1983), Engineering (R. M. Birse, 1983) and Agriculture (I. J. Fleming and N. F. Robertson, 1990), and these, together with Birse's *Science at the University of Edinburgh 1583-1993*, serve to update the *History of the University* produced



by A. Logan Turner in 1933. Each study has been the result of great individual dedication, and Charles Smith, Professor Collee and the Wellcome Unit at Glasgow are to be congratulated on putting together the funding for such an extensive treatment of an important topic. Perhaps inevitably it has not been possible to make a critical assessment of the value of the work done in Edinburgh and its place in the history of the subject, but facts may precede evaluation and this book will provide an invaluable quarry for future scholars. One hopes that, at a time when university departments are losing identity and being regrouped in interdisciplinary research consortia and overarching institutes, the older records will end up safely in the University Archives and ways will be found to record the twentieth-century history of other departments before they disappear. Few will achieve the depth and detail of *Edinburgh's Contribution to Microbiology*: not everyone will need a copy on their shelves, but it is splendid to record that the book exists.

ANDREW FRASER, *Department of Medical Microbiology, University of Edinburgh*

Alan Lugton, **The Making of Hibernian**. *Edinburgh: John Donald, 1995, pp. viii + 280, illus. Hardback, £14.95, 0-85976-424-9.*

Most histories of football clubs are of interest to few readers other than the supporter. Alan Lugton's book covers the period between 1876 and 1903, and the first part is of more than sporting relevance because it is concerned with the growth and character of the Irish community in Edinburgh. It was 12,000 strong in 1841, that is to say before the Irish Famine. Hibernian were the football team of the Catholic Young Men's Society at St Patrick's Church, off the Cowgate. They were founded during the celebration of the centenary of the birth of Daniel O'Connell, and moved to Easter Road in 1880, following the rapid growth of the Irish population in Leith. The book gives a valuable picture of the Edinburgh Irish and their institutions. Unfortunately *The Making of Hibernian* has neither references nor a list of sources; the publishers have not done justice to Mr Lugton's assiduous research.

JOHN BURNETT, *Royal Museum of Scotland*

James U. Thomson, **Edinburgh Curiosities: A Capital Cornucopia**. *Edinburgh: John Donald, 1996, pp. iv + 156, illus. Paperback, £7.50, 0-85976-449-4.*

Over the years James Thomson has written many historical articles for the Edinburgh *Evening News* and the *Scotsman*. Some of them form the basis of this book, which amiably describes itself as a 'hotchpotch' of stories from the past of Edinburgh (and Leith).

The first third of the book is concerned with crime in Edinburgh, including accounts of the rather squalid and bleak misdeeds of those hanged in Calton Gaol, and piquant details of their executions. Later, along with the stories of some well known Edinburgh criminals Thomson tells the less familiar one of James Steele, the Dalry forger imprisoned at the age of eighty, whose counterfeit coins impressed the Mint.

Away from crime, there is an interesting account of the building (and the rebuildings) of the North and South Bridges, and of the townscape they replaced. Still in the Old Town, stories of the High Street tenement collapse and the 1824 fire are stirringly recounted with the help of contemporary newspaper articles.

Eyewitness accounts from Thomson's own family lore inform one of the most intriguing chapters, on the bombing of the first Elizabeth II post-box in Scotland by person(s) unknown. The story of the loss of 214 men of the Leith battalion of the Royal Scots in the 1915 Quintinshill railway disaster is made horrifyingly vivid by the memories of Thomson's father, who was on the troop train (although Thomson mistakes the location of the train that caused the crash).

This 'hotchpotch' is perhaps best dipped into, rather than read right through, but the dipping will yield intriguing sidelights to anyone familiar with the Capital. This is especially true of the tantalisingly laconic answers to the 100 Quiz questions at the back of the book. Why *did* the Icelandic national anthem come to be written at No. 15 London Street?

MARTIN TYSON, *Scottish Record Office*



Elizabeth Sanderson, **Women and Work in Eighteenth Century Edinburgh**. London: Macmillan Press, 1996, pp. xii + 236, illus. Hardback, £40.00, 0-312-12917-3.

This monograph, one of a series of *Studies in Gender History*, radically alters our perception of the life of ordinary women in eighteenth-century Edinburgh. This is no study of the salons of the 'Hotbed of Genius', but an investigation of the women who brought the citizens of Edinburgh into the world, clothed them, nursed them and finally dressed them in their 'deid-claes' – women in the retail trade, mantua-makers and milliners, sicknurses and wet-nurses, room-setters, rousing women and graves-clothes makers. Single, married or widowed, these were no ciphers of their husbands or male relations, but independent tradeswomen who worked to support themselves and their families.

Edinburgh's economy at this period was one of credit not cash, of bespoke fashions not ready-made clothes. Women set up shop together, the 'Jenny-a'things' sold a wide variety of goods, and others ran very specialised businesses. The sisters Helen and Jane Norrie, probably related to the painters John and Robert, ran a shop selling artists' materials; Mary Erskine, the wife of an engraver, sold patterns for embroidery and gave classes at her shop at the 'Hand and Pen'. Perhaps the most surprising thing to emerge from this study is the involvement of women from all classes. Middle class women were not cut off from the outside world, retreating into the domesticity of their family as they would in the nineteenth century. Here we see the wives and daughters of lawyers, professors, surgeons and merchants playing a full role in the commercial life of the capital. Take Janet Anderson, for example, the daughter of James Anderson, WS and author of *Diplomata Scotiae*, who was both a milliner and a graves-clothes maker. Like many other women shopkeepers, she travelled to London frequently to buy stock, on one occasion almost losing her life and her cargo in a storm. Many girls from good families set up businesses with no apparent slur on their status as gentlewomen. Their family connections were often useful as business contacts.

Dr Sanderson has marshalled a mass of information culled from many underused record sources – the minute books of the Merchant Company of Edinburgh, the burgh court processes in

the Edinburgh City Archives, the Commissary Court and Court of Session processes, taxation records and a wide range of private papers in the Scottish Record Office. The depth of her research is reflected in four appendices which are a mine of information on a sample of shopkeepers, single women in business, women working at all levels of the textile and grocery trades, and wives and widows in business. As the index is essentially to subjects, it does not always serve the text: some women who appear in the text can be found neither in the index nor appendices.

The book is a fascinating read, refreshingly free of the jargon which can sometimes mar such studies. My only cavil is with the publisher, who has done Dr Sanderson's study a disservice in the poor quality of reproduction of the illustrations and the hefty cover price.

ALISON ROSIE, *Scottish Record Office*

Stuart Harris, **The Place Names of Edinburgh: Their Origins and History**. Edinburgh: Gordon Wright, 1996, pp. 654, illus. Hardback, £45.00, 0-903065-83-5.

A Martian seeking clues about Scotland's political epicentre by peering at Edinburgh's street names might understandably be misled into concluding that the House of Hanover, so emphatically commemorated in the centre of the Capital, still occupied the pinnacle of society. Later, acting on good information, our visitor could make for Windsor Street in the expectation of finding a mighty boulevard named for the ruling dynasty. The modest collection of Regency houses at that address would be a lesson in the low-key and unpompous way that the nation's political life has mostly been reflected in its street names. Likewise, Union Street might prove a disappointment, but provide a hint as to why at Parliament Square no people's representatives could be found. Not for conservative Edinburgh the renamings by which one regime erases the memory of another, for we have famously suffered fewer modern revolutions or upheavals than many other nations, and political correctness has only marginally affected the naming of the city's streets. Scotland's rulers and heroes are there to be sure, but our Martian would learn more about Edinburgh's dead burgesses and citizens than our dynasties from a study of street

name derivations. Human and extraterrestrial readers of Stuart Harris's *The Place Names of Edinburgh*, a huge and hugely diverting compendium of many aspects of Edinburgh's story, will come away with much absorbing information which adds to their understanding and enjoyment of the city.

Before publication of this book, those seeking answers on the derivations of Edinburgh's street names or on her topography, had to turn to the cursory account given in *The History and Derivation of Edinburgh Street Names*, published by the City Engineers as a swansong of Edinburgh Corporation in 1975. Twenty one years later local government has changed again, and it is fitting that Stuart Harris's massive study should now supersede the earlier work and stand as a monument to the extraordinary achievement of the author, who died shortly after publication of this book. For he has provided as much information as many will want to know about the origins of the city's place names, and more than enough to stimulate further work by the topographically or etymologically curious.

Harris built on the foundations laid by Charles Boog Watson, the eminent authority on the city's history whose notebooks provided the matter for the 1975 volume, and the City's own record of names. He studied painstakingly as many historic maps of Edinburgh and its hinterland as he could locate, and in addition he traced the evolution of names in primary and secondary evidence, and interpreted them in the light of linguistic evidence. The range of sources consulted and the masterly fashion in which the author marshals his material are truly impressive, and it is difficult to envisage that his work will be superseded as one of the major reference works on the history of the city. For it yields much more than simply the names and dates of streets, and acts as a kind of topographically-based encyclopaedia.

The entries are arranged alphabetically by place name with ample cross-references, and italics and capitals to denote sources and names within entries. The arrangement works well and is easy to use, although some anachronistic terms such as the 'Calton New Town' are used for convenience. Harris gives us a crisp treatment of the evolution of Edinburgh's own name and that of its castle, and has interesting things to say in almost every other entry from Abbey Close to Zetland Place. The popular idea

of Burdiehouse's origins as a haunt of French immigrants is neatly and convincingly dissected, and at Jock's Lodge we encounter not a jolly innkeeper, but the Bluegowns, who called themselves 'Jockies' and were licensed by the King to beg. The book covers the city district as defined in 1975, and the changes wrought within the area over the centuries are the focus of the long and informative introduction. It summarises the development not only of place names, but also of the accelerated changes in Edinburgh's topography during the past 250 years as housing and industry swallowed the city's rural hinterland. Not the least of Harris's achievements is to record the names which have been lost to urbanisation, lovely Scots terms reflecting the qualities or features of the terrain recorded by its long-gone inhabitants: Bonnyfield, Honeymug, Double Dykes, Mounthooly and countless others. The verbal descriptions are supplemented by ten pages of maps and no fewer than 113 black and white illustrations of Edinburgh topography, which add greatly to the value of the book.

The author gives fascinating glimpses of the underlying structure on which Edinburgh literally rests. At the Jewel on the east of the city, three picturesque street names given to a new development in the 1980s record the outcropping coal seams, North Greens, Corbieshot and Parrotshot, which caused the area to be mined. This suggests that developers pay more heed to history than is generally thought. The rash of quaint addresses attached to modern brick housing schemes do sometimes reflect historic names. When the site of Corstorphine Station was being filled with houses in 1983 it was named Paddockholm, which sounds suspiciously as if coined to evoke a rural idyll. However, as Harris tells us, the name appears on a map of 1777, and he suggests that paddock may relate to puddocks (frogs) rather than horses. The linguistic point is repeated in the case of Puddockie at Canonmills, which occurs in 1724 as Paddockhall, in other words the haugh or meadow of the puddocks.

The book is full of such entertaining interpretations, but at times the author's speculations fill space inconclusively. Thus for the Quality Streets at Davidson's Mains and Leith, we are told twice that J. M. Barrie noted the name at Leith and North Berwick in connection with his play of the same



name, but the significance of this fact is left unexplained, and one concludes that it is considered interesting *per se*. Similar repetitious information occurs elsewhere, and it is a matter of taste whether the slightly antiquarian tone will impede readers or add to their enjoyment. There is an agreeably leisurely quality to much of this toponymical exploration, but even the more laconic paragraphs contain much matter. More economies of expression might have reduced the book's considerable bulk without sacrificing clarity.

For one man to have gathered so much information is a great achievement, so it is not surprising that further primary sources, such as sasines and testamentary records, remain to be fully explored to confirm or revise the multitude of interpretations with which we are presented. For example, the author failed to uncover any evidence for the gunpowder manufactory which gave its name to Powderhall, although it is clear from Peter Vasey's research (elsewhere in this volume of *BOEC*) that it functioned as such. Harris suggests that a story of such a mill became attached to an existing name meaning *poldre haw*, or marshy haugh, and changed it to Powderhall. The ingenious linguistic surmise is paralleled elsewhere, but is here based on insufficient research in historical sources. This cautionary note should not detract from the solid work which the book contains in abundance, and Harris was well aware that in attempting an authoritative account there is always room for more work. His book will surely provide the necessary stimulus. As the reference point for future writers on Edinburgh's history it will probably, and deservedly, become known simply as 'Harris'.

TRISTRAM CLARKE, *Scottish Record Office*

Joyce M. Wallace, **Traditions of Trinity and Leith**. *Edinburgh: John Donald, revised edn 1997, pp. xii + 240, illus. Paperback, £9.95, 0-85976-447-8.*

Edinburgh's northern border has been the subject of three books by Joyce Wallace, a well respected local historian who possesses the ability to write in a lively and accessible way about an area of Edinburgh that she knows and loves.

The original text of *Traditions of Trinity and Leith*, published in 1985, was based on a series of articles and was not written from the beginning as a book. *Further Traditions of Trinity and Leith* followed in 1990, and was intended as 'the second in a two-part history of Trinity, the western dormitory suburb of the Port of Leith'. The 1997 version of *Traditions of Trinity and Leith* is 'revised' and 'extended', and it follows the same format as the first edition, with new chapters on Challenger Lodge (St Columba's Hospice), on Trinity Mains Farmhouse and Woodbine Cottage and notable additional material on Granton House. Other areas have been rearranged and the text enlarged, so that whereas in the first edition Trinity's history occupied approximately one third of the book now it is about one half. It has not, however, incorporated all the information about Trinity contained in *Further Traditions*.

Since 1985 other authors and publishers have produced local histories on Newhaven and on Leith, notably James Scott Marshall's *The Life and Times of Leith* (John Donald 1986), and one wonders whether, rather than revising and extending *Traditions of Trinity and Leith*, the publishers and author considered a companion volume to Joyce Wallace's *Canonmills and Inverleith* (John Donald 1994) on Trinity alone, consolidating and expanding the material in *Traditions* and *Further Traditions* and working within a defined area bounded by, say, the Shore on the north, Granton Road on the west, Ferry Road on the south and the Dudleys to the east.

Wallace has a talent for bringing people and places to life and it would be of interest if she could include the history of the nineteenth- and twentieth-century developments ranging from tenements, the stone terraced houses of the Dudleys and Denholm Green and the terraces and semi-detached houses around Lomond Park, which are not mentioned. One of the distinguishing characteristics of Trinity is the wide variety of houses within a relatively small area which reflect the gradual development from small houses and villas in the country to prosperous suburb serving both Edinburgh and Leith which came with the railways and improved road transport.

Disappointingly *Traditions of Trinity and Leith* contains only two very small maps. More, larger scale and clearer maps would greatly enhance the reader's understanding of the development of the

area. The new edition has been typeset (previously it was filmset) and a number of spelling errors have not been corrected; the most irritating of these is 'Challenger' on every right-hand page of the chapter on Challenger Lodge. It seems to be a characteristic of the local histories from this publishing house that there are no footnotes and little to indicate the source of the material. A bibliography would be useful to both historians and to general readers.

Notwithstanding these comments this is a book that those interested in the history of Trinity and Leith should acquire for the new material it contains.  
JOCELYN CUNLIFFE

Lynne Gladstone-Millar, **The Reverend Robert Walker Skating on Duddingston Loch (circa 1784) by Sir Henry Raeburn (1756-1823). The Story Behind the Painting.** *Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 1997, pp. 48, illus. Paperback, £4.99, 0-7152-0748-2*

Duncan Thomson, **Raeburn: The Art of Sir Henry Raeburn, 1756-1823.** *Edinburgh: Scottish National Portrait Gallery, 1997, pp. 215, illus. Paperback, £19.95, 0903598-69-8.*

The Reverend Robert Walker skating on Duddingston Loch is probably Scotland's best-known and loved painting, and Lynne Gladstone-Millar's short book draws an interesting and very readable portrait of its subject. Walker was a son of the manse of Monkton in Ayrshire, born in 1755 and brought up in Rotterdam, where his father served the Scots Kirk from 1760. The young Robert trained for the ministry, became the minister of Cramond in 1776 at the age of twenty one, and in 1784 advanced his career by moving to the Canongate Kirk, where his grandfather had also served.

While at Cramond he became a member of the Royal Company of Archers, and in the next year, 1780, of the Edinburgh Skating Club, which obliged him to make the seven-mile trip to Duddingston to enjoy his sport. Raeburn's depiction of him on the ice, perhaps practising the manoeuvres which the club prescribed, is dated by family tradition to about 1784. The various facets of Walker's life are agreeably described, from the social life of

Edinburgh during the decline of the Old Town, including the exotic presence of French royal exiles from the 1790s, to its sporting activity. In addition to his skating, Walker had been 'no mean player' at the Dutch game of 'kolf', and he wrote a valuable description of it in the *Statistical Account of Scotland*, for it was of interest to Scots as a variant of their own golf. The colourful background to Walker's life which the author provides is enlivened by numerous illustrations. Much more remains to be discovered than this work aims to achieve about the sporting societies such as those to which Walker belonged, and the networks of kinship and patronage which characterised Enlightenment Edinburgh, but this modest book is recommended to anyone with an interest in Edinburgh's history and to the skating minister's many admirers.

The catalogue of the momentous exhibition of Raeburn's portraits which the Scottish National Portrait Gallery mounted in 1997 is an altogether weightier affair. The retiring Keeper, Duncan Thomson, who was mainly responsible for the exhibition, contributes a valuable essay on the painter's development and technique, and another on Raeburn's life which is of particular interest for Edinburgh's history. We learn of the humble beginnings of this native of Stockbridge, and his socially advantageous marriage to Ann Edgar, a widow in possession of the Deanhaugh estate, which the Raeburn family later feued for housing. Thomson is especially interesting on the topography of Raeburn's Edinburgh and its influence on his painting. During the 1790s he established himself in 'the first business in Edinburgh', in Henry Mackenzie's words, and produced an output of about one thousand portraits before his death in 1823. Business of a different kind, in the form of mercantile activity and insurance underwriting, caused the bankruptcy of Scotland's leading portraitist in 1808 and, like the bankrupt Walter Scott, he honourably plied his art to rectify the calamity. This episode can also be traced in the useful appendix of documentary sources, which will be valuable for further research into all aspects of his career.

In the catalogue proper the numerous excellent reproductions form a fascinating gallery of sitters, while the notes to each painting provide helpful biographical information as well as perceptive



studies of Raeburn's technique. For example, in a masterly treatment of the Walker portrait Thomson argues that there is no evidence for the over-painting of the face for the benefit of Walker's widow after his death in 1808, which has been suggested to explain the discrepancy between the traditional date of 1784 and the subject's age. Persuasively he suggests a date of 1792-93 to reconcile the style of the painting and Walker's appearance. To Nicholas Phillipson the picture is a 'Scottish moralist's gentle joke', for in his essay in the catalogue he reads into Raeburn's depiction of the disciplined mastery of skating skills a metaphor for the self-command and grasp of abstract philosophy which Walker displayed as a minister and member of Edinburgh's enlightened elite.

In his fascinating study of the social and intellectual context of Raeburn's portraits, Phillipson paints a subtler and more complex picture of Edinburgh and Scottish society than Gladstone-Miller. The paintings form what he describes as 'an extraordinary visual biography of elite Scottish society in the later years of the Scottish Enlightenment'. He places Raeburn in an Edinburgh which had rediscovered itself as a provincial capital where the minor nobility and gentry and the professional classes held sway. Cultural life was expressed in various ways, including the university, some of whose leading members Raeburn immortalised, and the many literary and philosophical clubs. In discussing the necessary components of a civilised society the members of the Mirror Club pointed up the sociable qualities of sincerity, candour and humanity, and it is tempting to read into Raeburn's portraits our understanding of just such attributes. His paintings are rooted in a time and place, and form part of particular artistic and cultural endeavours which Thomson and his collaborators explore in a very rewarding book, but ultimately it is the simple humanity of Raeburn's perception of his subjects which moves and delights us, and stirs us to ponder life in Edinburgh two centuries ago.

TRISTRAM CLARKE, *Scottish Record Office*

David Daiches, Peter Jones and Jean Jones (eds), **The Scottish Enlightenment, 1730-1790: A Hotbed of Genius.** *Edinburgh:*

*Saltire Society, 1996, pp. 160, illus. Paperback, £14.99, 0-85411-0690-0.*

It is a great pleasure to see this excellent book, originally published by Edinburgh University Press in 1986, available once again. Although this is a new edition, with the title rearranged and a revised preface, the main text has been reprinted without changes in annotation or bibliography. To summarise the aim of the work one can do no better than quote from the cover of the original edition (for that of the new is less well expressed). The book examines a movement of which the motivation was 'by studying the laws of human behaviour and the historical processes of change, to gain a fuller understanding of the present, and so to build a better future, and free mankind from ignorance and poverty. This book illustrates how the world of today has been shaped by the thinkers and experimenters of 18th-century Scotland. In all kinds of practical ways they changed the face of medicine and chemistry, of geology and architecture, of economics and politics, of sociology and anthropology, of psychology and philosophy.'

The six essays which make up the volume are lively and full of original insight. David Daiches writes on the Scottish Enlightenment in general, in a wide-ranging essay which analyses the range and characteristics of that remarkable intellectual phenomenon, providing a fitting complement to several of his other publications on this and the related field of Scottish culture in the eighteenth century. There follow studies of the lives and achievement of four of the key personalities in the movement, all men of genius whose influence then and ever since has been profound. Peter Jones contributes on David Hume; Adam Smith is discussed by D. D. Raphael; Robert Anderson writes on Joseph Black; and James Hutton is discussed by Jean Jones. Archie Turnbull, the original publisher of the book, offers a stimulating chapter on the influence of Scottish Enlightenment thought in America, and it is no doubt with a eye to the lucrative American undergraduate market that the Saltire Society has undertaken this reissue. For the Scottish Enlightenment, if not so powerful an academic interest as it was between the later 1960s and the mid 1980s, is still sound commercial sense in publishing terms.

The original edition was produced to coincide with a gathering of international scholarly talent under the auspices of the Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities of the University of Edinburgh in the spring and summer of 1986, under the acronym 'IPSE' (Institute Project Scottish Enlightenment). To be a part of this, or just to be in Edinburgh that summer, was to have felt something akin to the sentiments of an English visitor of the 1770s, Mr Amyat, the King's Chemist, who is recorded by William Smellie as having been greatly impressed by Edinburgh and its vibrant intellectual scene: 'Here I stand at what is called the Cross of Edinburgh, and can, in a few minutes, take fifty men of genius and learning by the hand'.

Associated with this programme was a major interdisciplinary exhibition in the National Museum of Scotland's York Buildings galleries. This important, appealing and memorable show took as its title a celebrated quotation from Smollett's *Humphrey Clinker*: 'Edinburgh is a hotbed of genius'. The editors of the volume were at pains to point out that, although Edinburgh was the centre of the Scottish Enlightenment, the phenomenon manifested itself in Glasgow, Aberdeen and indeed throughout Lowland Scotland, and was, of course, part of a European movement. Nevertheless it is difficult to resist the temptation to identify the Enlightenment largely with Edinburgh; and this is why the cover of the original edition struck one as oddly perverse - a picture of the old buildings of Glasgow College! For this new edition, the pudgy features of David Hume stare out at us in Allan Ramsay's marvellous portrayal of 1766. More than anyone else, Hume - citizen of London and Paris as much as Edinburgh (though it was to Edinburgh that he returned with pleasure to live in contented retirement) represents the internationalism inherent in the Scottish Enlightenment. Yet in this image, so well reflecting the description by Lord Charlemont of the philosopher as a 'turtle-eating alderman', we see also the beefy Scottish common sense which underpinned, and made intimate and comfortingly insular, in the small circles of Edinburgh's Select Society or the later Oyster Club, the high-flown intellectual achievements of the leaders of European thought.

The 'Hotbed of Genius' exhibition was remarkable for its assemblage of so much visual material brought together to illustrate the story of the Scottish Enlightenment - a phenomenon which, by its very nature, is the product of the human intellect as expressed in manuscript page or printed book, or else in the debate and conversation of the learned or literary assembly or at the dinner tables of a polite and urban (or urbane) society. The 'Hotbed' book preserves much of the excitement of the exhibition; it is an enormously valuable and instructive album of images drawn from every conceivable source. Pictures themselves often well known in other contexts are used in a particularly enterprising way to illustrate important philosophical, economic, political or scientific points: p. 60 in the Hume section, pp. 81 and 85 in the Adam Smith chapter, p. 110 in the Black essay, and p. 122 in the Hutton survey are good examples of the method. The book is splendidly illustrated; and it is no exaggeration to say that these pictures are, in their way, almost as useful as the texts they illustrate. It is, therefore, perhaps a little unfortunate to see that the original acknowledgements to the small team of scholars and curators who assisted in gathering illustrations and in making suggestions about the balance and shape of the book as a whole in 1986 have been dispensed with in the new edition.

The book is a delight to read and to handle, and everyone interested in the culture and intellectual achievement of later eighteenth-century Scotland should have it (or the original edition) for ready reference. The elegance of its design is all the more remarkable when one realises that the original edition was produced in only four months: Archie Turnbull subsequently recalled that co-ordinating the team of editors, designer, compositor and production controller was 'like playing at being Diaghileff'! The reissue has not allowed for any correction of the (remarkably few) errors, nor for a revised collection of illustrations. Thus the odd caption to the photograph of the Hume mausoleum on p. 66 remains after the suggestions made therein (with such confidence, but upon no foundations of evidence) have been disproved.

*IAIN GORDON BROWN, National Library of Scotland*



Malcolm Cant, **Edinburgh: Gorgie and Dalry**. *Edinburgh: Malcolm Cant Publications, 1995, pp. 264, illus. Paperback, £9.95, 0-9526099-0-8.*

Malcolm Cant, **Villages of Edinburgh: An Illustrated Guide, Volume 1**. *Edinburgh: Malcolm Cant Publications, 1997, pp. 183, illus. Paperback, £9.95, 0-9526099-1-6.*

When James Grant's *Old and New Edinburgh* appeared in three large quarto volumes in 1880-83 it must have seemed that everything worth knowing about the city and its surroundings had been brought together in the definitive work on Edinburgh. For equivalent cover today we have to add an ever-expanding series of reasonably priced octavo books covering different areas and districts individually, explaining the development of the roads and streets, the spread of industry and housing out from the old town centre, the filling in of former estates and farms with new developments, the swallowing up of old villages in modern suburbs. These books are essential reference for all with an interest in their own areas, and together they bring the local history of the city and its suburbs through the accelerating changes of the twentieth century towards the millennium.

Malcolm Cant has already produced several such volumes, and more are promised. First *Marchmont*, then *Sciennes and the Grange*, and two volumes on *The Villages of Edinburgh* which are now joined by *Gorgie and Dalry*, with *Greenbank* just over the horizon. The format established when the original volumes were published by John Donald has been retained though the author has taken over publication himself, with a generous selection of old and new black and white photographs punctuating the text. All are the result of painstaking research in libraries and on the ground, with wide consultation with appropriate authorities in all the areas covered. The range is broad, with industry, sport and entertainment joining the more traditional old buildings, churches and schools. The text is easily read, uncluttered with specific references, but with full lists of further reading for those who wish to track down original details. In practice, these volumes will become in their turn, like Grant's *Old*

*and New Edinburgh*, primary sources cited by future authors for a great mass of previously unrecorded or inaccessible detail.

*Gorgie and Dalry* is a new work, which traces the development of the inner city suburb from the original rural Dalry House in the Lands of Dalry as industry and housing spread out along the wedge between the Union Canal and the Caledonian Railway. To the west, beyond the Suburban and South Side Railway, the lands of the old mansions of Gorgie, Stenhouse and Saughton Hall remained open ground until the twentieth century. Cant deals first with the early history of these and adjoining estates and then brings the story up through the nineteenth century. Later chapters are thematically structured to cover churches and mission halls; schools; commercial and industrial developments; sport; and entertainment, leisure and education; with a final section containing reminiscences and recent community developments. Whether your interests tend towards Cox's Glue Works, Poole's Roxy Cinema, the Chieslies of Dalry, Heart of Midlothian Football Club, Dalry House Day Centre or the Scottish National Exhibition of 1908 at Saughton Hall, a glance at the index will start you off and leave you browsing happily forward and backwards as other topics and photos catch the eye.

*Villages of Edinburgh* is a revised version of two volumes originally produced in 1986-87: the first covers a ring of old village centres to the north of the city and is to be followed by an up-dated Volume 2 for the south. There are some changes in contents, e.g. the omission of Newcraighall from the first volume and Burdiehouse from the second (but with the promised addition of Slateford). The present volume deals with Corstorphine, Cramond, Davidson's Mains, Dean, Duddingston, Newhaven, Restalrig and Stockbridge (Portobello and Leith presumably excluded as towns rather than villages, Blackhall perhaps as too late and Canonmills as too fragmentary?). Many of the photos are new – including aerial views and even the discovery of the Cramond Lion by the ferryman in January 1997 – and much of the text has been recast as user-friendly descriptions of walks in place of the previous more chronological treatment. New maps are provided (though that of Corstorphine has been awkwardly printed upside down). The book gives an excellent

guide to each old village, though inevitably tailing off as the hinterland is reached – Prestonfield House receives only a few perfunctory lines at the end of the Duddingston section. Several of the villages dealt with here are already the subject of specialised

histories (listed in the bibliography) but the present volume provides a stimulating introduction to interesting parts of the enlarged city and suggestions for fascinating exploratory walks.

*ANDREW FRASER*